



**THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

**(Lack Of Justiciable Controversy)**

Intervenors fail to raise a justiciable controversy between Intervenors and Defendants because Intervenors' claims are not ripe and/or are moot.

**FOURTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

**(Abstention)**

The Court must abstain from resolving any justiciable controversy because Intervenors' claims are premature as the Legislature has sufficient time to enact redistricting legislation.

WHEREFORE, Defendants respectfully request that the Court:

1. Dismiss Intervenors' claims with prejudice and enter judgment for Defendants;
- and
2. Grant such other relief to Defendants as the Court may deem just and proper.

Dated: March 7, 2012

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Michael A. Carvin

Michael A. Carvin (MC 9266)  
JONES DAY  
51 Louisiana Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20001-2113  
202/879-3939

Todd R. Geremia (TG 4454)  
JONES DAY  
222 East 41st Street  
New York, NY 10017-6702  
212/326-3939

David Lewis (DL 0037)  
LEWIS & FIORE  
225 Broadway, Suite 3300  
New York, NY 10007  
212/285-2290

*Attorneys For Defendants Dean G. Skelos, Michael  
F. Nozzolio, and Welquis R. Lopez*

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that, on this 7th day of March, 2012, a true and correct copy of the foregoing was served on the following counsel of record through the Court's CM/ECF system:

Richard Mancino  
Daniel Max Burstein  
Jeffrey Alan Williams  
WILLKIE FARR & GALLAGHER  
787 Seventh Avenue  
New York, NY 10019

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

Leonard M. Kohen  
67 E. 11th Street #703  
New York, NY 10003

*Attorney for Defendants John L. Sampson  
and Martin Malave Dilan*

Harold D. Gordon  
Couch White, LLP  
540 Broadway  
Albany, NY 12201

*Attorney for Defendant Brian M. Kolb*

James D. Herschlein  
KAYE SCHOLER LLP  
425 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10022

*Attorney for Intervenors Lee,  
Chung, Hong, and Lang*

Jeffrey Dean Vanacore  
Perkins Coie LLP  
30 Rockefeller Center, 25th Floor  
New York, NY 10112

*Attorney for Rose Proposed Intervenors*

Joshua Pepper  
Assistant Attorney General  
120 Broadway, 24th Floor  
New York, NY 10271

*Attorney for Defendants Andrew M. Cuomo,  
Eric T. Schneiderman, and Robert J. Duffy*

Jonathan Sinnreich  
SINNREICH KOSAKOFF & MESSINA LLP  
267 Carleton Avenue, Suite 301  
Central Islip, NY 11722

*Attorney for Defendant Robert Oaks*

Joan P. Gibbs  
Center for Law and Social Justice  
1150 Carroll Street  
Brooklyn, NY 11225

*Attorney for Intervenors Drayton, Ellis,  
Forrest, Johnson, Woolley, and Wright*

Jackson Chin  
LatinoJustice PRLDEF  
99 Hudson Street, 14th Floor  
New York, NY 10013

*Attorney for Intervenors Ramos, Chavarria,  
Heymann, Martinez, Roldan, and Tirado*

/s/Michael A. Carvin