

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

----- X
MARK A. FAVORS, HOWARD LEIB, :
LILLIE H. GALAN, EDWARD A. :
MULRAINE, WARREN SCHREIBER, and :
WEYMAN A. CAREY, :

Plaintiffs, :

and :

DONNA KAY DRAYTON, EDWIN ELLIS, :
AIDA FORREST, GENE A. JOHNSON, JOY :
WOOLLEY, and SHELIA WRIGHT, :

Plaintiff-Intervenors, :

and :

LINDA LEE, SHING CHOR CHUNG, JULIA :
YANG, JUNG HO HONG, :

Plaintiff-Intervenors, :

and :

JUAN RAMOS, NICK CHAVARRIA, :
GRACIELA HEYMANN, SANDRA :
MARTINEZ, EDWIN ROLDAN, MANOLIN :
TIRADO, :

Plaintiff-Intervenors, :

and :

LINDA ROSE, EVERET MILLS, ANTHONY :
HOFFMANN, KIM THOMPSON- :
WEREKOH, CARLOTTA BISHOP, CAROL :
RINZLER, GEORGE STAMATIADES, :
JOSEPHINE RODRIGUEZ, and SCOTT :
AUSTER, :

Plaintiff-Intervenors, :

v. :

ANDREW M. CUOMO, as Governor of the :
State of New York, ROBERT J. DUFFY, as :
President of the Senate of the State of New :
York, DEAN G. SKELOS, as Majority Leader :
and President Pro Tempore of the Senate of the :
State of New York, SHELDON SILVER, as

Case No. 1:11-cv-05632 (DLI)(RR)(GEL)

ROSE INTERVENORS' RESPONSE TO
MAGISTRATE'S REPORT AND
RECOMMENDATION

Speaker of the Assembly of the State of New York, JOHN L. SAMPSON, as Minority Leader of the Senate of the State of New York, BRIAN M. KOLB, as Minority Leader of the Assembly of the State of New York, the NEW YORK STATE LEGISLATIVE TASK FORCE ON DEMOGRAPHIC RESEARCH AND REAPPORTIONMENT (“LATFOR”), JOHN J. McENENY, as Member of LATFOR, ROBERT OAKS, as Member of LATFOR, ROMAN HEDGES, as Member of LATFOR, MICHAEL F. NOZZOLIO, as Member of LATFOR, MARTIN MALAVE DILAN, as Member of LATFOR, and WELQUIS R. LOPEZ, as Member of LATFOR,

Defendants.

----- x

Plaintiff-Intervenors Linda Rose, Everet Mills, Anthony Hoffmann, Kim Thompson-Werekoh, Carlotta Bishop, Carol Rinzler, George Stamatiades, Josephine Rodriguez, and Scott Auster (the “Rose Intervenors”) have no objection to the Magistrate’s Report and Recommendation.

Dated: March 14, 2012

By: /s/ Marc Erik Elias
Marc Erik Elias (appearing *pro hac vice*)
John Devaney (appearing *pro hac vice*)
Perkins Coie, LLP
700 13th St., N.W., Suite 600
Washington, D.C. 20005-3960
Phone: (202) 654-6200
Fax: (202) 654-6211
MElias@perkinscoie.com
JDevaney@perkinscoie.com

Kevin J. Hamilton (appearing *pro hac vice*)
Perkins Coie, LLP
1201 Third Ave, Suite 4800
Seattle, WA 98101-3099
Phone: (206) 359-8000
Fax: (206) 359-9000
KHamilton@perkinscoie.com

Jeffrey D. Vanacore
Perkins Coie LLP
30 Rockefeller Center, 25th Floor
New York, NY 10112-0085
Phone: (212) 262-6900
Fax: (212) 977-1635
JVanacore@perkinscoie.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff-Intervenors