

# EXHIBIT I

CLOSED, LEAD

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:02-cv-00618-RMB-FM**

Rodriguez, et al v. Pataki, et al  
Assigned to: Judge Richard M. Berman  
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Frank Maas  
Demand: \$0  
Related Cases: [1:02-cv-03239-RMB-JGK](#)  
[1:02-cv-03843-RMB-JGK](#)

Date Filed: 01/25/2002  
Date Terminated: 03/19/2004  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 441 Civil Rights: Voting  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Case in other court: 04-00218  
Cause: 28:1343 Violation of Civil Rights

**Special Master**

**Frederick B. Lacey**

**Plaintiff**

**Eric Rodriguez**

represented by **Gregory Charles Soumas**  
Gregory C. Soumas  
225 Broadway  
8th floor  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 619-5400  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**H. Reed Witherby**  
Smith and Duggan, L.L.P.  
Two Center Plaza  
Boston, MA 02108  
(617) 248-1900  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**James R. Jubilee**  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*

represented by **Gregory Charles Soumas**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Martin Malave-Divan**

represented by **Gregory Charles Soumas**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff****Patricia McDow**represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY***Plaintiff****Lisa Best**represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY***Plaintiff****Victor Oluwole**represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY***Plaintiff****Ruben Rangel**represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY***Plaintiff****Iris Pellerano**represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY***Plaintiff****Russell Velazquez**represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY***Plaintiff****Guillermo Linares**represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY***Plaintiff****Isabel Evangelista**represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY***Plaintiff****Martha L. Pepin**represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY***Plaintiff****Marisefa Reyes**represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Maria Urena**

represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Tyrone Zimmerman**

represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Jose Alvarado**

represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Irvin McManus**

represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Wayne Hall**

represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Samuel Prioleau**

represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**William Rodriguez**

represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Neville Mullings**

represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Mary Adams**

represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Eugene A. Burnett, Sr.**

represented by **H. Reed Witherby**

(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Hazel Palmore**

represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Johnny W. Velez**

represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Judith Cruz**

represented by **H. Reed Witherby**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Martha L. Evangelista**

V.

**Defendant**

**George E. Pataki**

*as Governor of the State of New York*

represented by **Fredric S. Newman**  
Hoguet Newman Regal & Kenney, LLP

10 East 40th Street  
35 Floor  
New York, NY 10016  
(212)-689-8808  
Fax: (212)-689-5101  
Email: fnewman@hnrklaw.com  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Ira Jonathan Lipton**  
Hoguet Newman Regal & Kenney, LLP

10 East 40th Street  
35 Floor  
New York, NY 10016  
(212)-689-8808  
Fax: (212)-689-5101  
Email: ilipton@hnrllaw.com  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Defendant**

**Lt. Governor Mary O. Donohue**  
*and President of The Senate of The*

represented by **Fredric S. Newman**  
(See above for address)

*State of New York*

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Todd Davis Valentine**

New York State Board of Elections  
40 Steuben Street

Albany, NY 12207

518 474 6367

Fax: 518 486 4546

Email: tvalentine@elections.state.ny.us

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Defendant**

**Eliot Spitzer**

*as Attorney General of the State of New York*

represented by **Eliot L. Spitzer**

Office of the Attorney General  
State of New York

120 Broadway

New York, NY 10271-0332

(212) 416-8280

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Joel Graber**

New York State Office of the Attorney  
General (24th Floor)

120 Broadway, 24th Floor

New York, NY 10271

(212) 416-8645

Fax: (212) 416-6075

Email: joel.graber@ag.ny.gov

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Defendant**

**Joseph L. Bruno**

*as President Pro Tempore and Majority  
Leader of the Senate of the State of New  
York*

represented by **Gregg M Mashberg**

Proskauer Rose LLP (NY)

11 Times Square

New York, NY 10036

(212) 969-3000

Fax: (212) 969-2900

Email: gmashberg@proskauer.com

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**John Richard Braatz**

Proskauer Rose LLP (NY)

11 Times Square

New York, NY 10036

212.969.3118

Fax: 212.969.2900

Email: jbraatz@proskauer.com

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Traci Leigh Lovitt**

Jones Day (NYC)  
222 East 41st Street  
New York, NY 10017  
(212) 326-3846  
Fax: (212) 755-7306  
Email: [tlovitt@jonesday.com](mailto:tlovitt@jonesday.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Defendant**

**Sheldon Silver**

*as Speaker of the Assembly of the State  
of New York*

represented by **C. Daniel Chill**  
Graubard, Miller  
600 Third Avenue  
New York, NY 10016  
(212) 818-8800  
Email: [dchill@graubard.com](mailto:dchill@graubard.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Nancy R. Sills**  
Graubard Miller  
600 Third Avenue  
New York, NY 10016  
(212) 818-8800  
Email: [NSills@graubard.com](mailto:NSills@graubard.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Nancy R. Sills**  
Graubard, Mollen, Horowitz, Pomeranz  
& Shapiro  
600 Third Avenue  
New York, NY 10016-1903  
(212) 818-8800  
Email: [NSills@graubard.com](mailto:NSills@graubard.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Defendant**

**John J. Faso**

*as Minority Leader of the Assembly of  
the State of New York*  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*

represented by **Brian Joseph Clark**  
Clifton Budd & DeMaria, LLP  
420 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10170  
(212)687-7410  
Fax: 212687 3285  
Email: [bjclark@cbdm.com](mailto:bjclark@cbdm.com)  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Defendant**

**Martin E. Connor**

*as Minority Leader of the Senate of the  
State of New York*  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*

represented by **Arnold J. Ludwig**  
250 Broadway  
Suite 1930  
New York, NY 10007

(212) 298-5597  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**H. Reed Witherby**  
Two Center Plaza  
Boston, MA 02108  
(617) 248-1900  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Defendant**

**Carol Berman**  
*as Commissioner of the New York State  
Board of Elections*

represented by **Todd Davis Valentine**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Defendant**

**Neil W. Kelleher**

represented by **Todd Davis Valentine**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Defendant**

**Evelyn J. Aquila**  
*as Commissioner of the New York State  
Board of Elections*

represented by **Todd Davis Valentine**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Mayra Cappas**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Raquel Emilia Batista**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Jose Dominguez**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Alice Cardona**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Genaro Herrera**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**David Galarza**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Latino Voting Rights Committee of  
Suffolk County**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Joseph Lopez**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Enrique Gomez**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Ann Jones**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Cherry Weinstein**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Lynn Elfe**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**David Gantt**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**William Johnson**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Wade Norwood**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Ronnie Thomas**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Arthur O. Eve**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Charles H. Fisher, III**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**James W. Pitts**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Beverly Gray**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**George A. Holt, Jr.**

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Louise Slaughter**

**Plaintiff**

**Howard T. Allen**

represented by **Henry T. Berger**  
127 West 77th Street  
New York, NY 10024

(212) 799-9378  
*TERMINATED: 03/07/2002*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Jeannette Santos**

represented by **Henry T. Berger**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 03/07/2002*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Donald J. Jirak**

represented by **Henry T. Berger**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 03/07/2002*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Richard Flateau**

represented by **Henry T. Berger**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 03/07/2002*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Charlotte A. Taylor**

represented by **Henry T. Berger**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 03/07/2002*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Mervyn A. Campbell**  
*TERMINATED: 03/07/2002*

represented by **Henry T. Berger**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 03/07/2002*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Sarah Brockus**

represented by **Henry T. Berger**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 03/07/2002*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Sandra Rivers**

represented by  
Center for Law and Social Justice  
Medgar Evers College  
City University of New York  
1150 Carroll Street  
Rooms CP-02 and CP-16  
Brooklyn, NY 11225  
(718) 270-6297

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Rosemari Mealy**

represented by

(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Ronald Cranshaw**

represented by

(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Sandra Bradford**

represented by

(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**George E. Pataki**

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Lt. Governor Mary O. Donohue**

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Eliot Spitzer**

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Joseph L. Bruno**

represented by **Gregg M Mashberg**

(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**John Richard Braatz**

(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Sheldon Silver**

**Intervenor Defendant**

**John J. Faso**

*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Martin E. Connor**

*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Carol Berman**

**Intervenor Defendant****Neil W. Kelleher****Intervenor Defendant****Evelyn J. Aquila****Intervenor Plaintiff****Raymond M. Fink***TERMINATED: 04/30/2002*represented by **David J. Molton**

Brown Rudnick LLP (NYC)

Seven Times Square

New York, NY 10036

212-209-4800

Fax: 212-704-0196

Email: [dmolton@brownrudnick.com](mailto:dmolton@brownrudnick.com)*TERMINATED: 04/30/2002**LEAD ATTORNEY***Gayle N. Wolkenberg**

Buchanan Ingersoll, P.C.

140 Broadway

35th Floor

New York, NY 10005

(646) 458-2340

*TERMINATED: 04/30/2002**LEAD ATTORNEY***Intervenor Plaintiff****Stephen P. Gocinski***TERMINATED: 04/30/2002*represented by **David J. Molton**

(See above for address)

*TERMINATED: 04/30/2002**LEAD ATTORNEY***Gayle N. Wolkenberg**

(See above for address)

*TERMINATED: 04/30/2002**LEAD ATTORNEY***Intervenor Plaintiff****John Quaglione***TERMINATED: 04/30/2002*represented by **David J. Molton**

(See above for address)

*TERMINATED: 04/30/2002**LEAD ATTORNEY***Gayle N. Wolkenberg**

(See above for address)

*TERMINATED: 04/30/2002**LEAD ATTORNEY***Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Patricia Mustaro**  
*TERMINATED: 04/30/2002*

represented by **David J. Molton**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 04/30/2002*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Gayle N. Wolkenberg**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 04/30/2002*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Lena Yu**  
*TERMINATED: 04/30/2002*

represented by **David J. Molton**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 04/30/2002*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Gayle N. Wolkenberg**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 04/30/2002*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**New York State Council of Black  
Elected Democrats**

represented by **Paul Wooten**  
Paul Wooten & Associates  
146 Lawrence Street  
Brooklyn, NY 11201  
(718)522-6590  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Leslie Barbour**

represented by **Paul Wooten**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Michelle Romero**

represented by **Paul Wooten**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**William O. Low**

represented by **Paul Wooten**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Cecilia Guterrez**

represented by **Paul Wooten**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Evelyn Miller**

represented by **Paul Wooten**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Seretta C. McKnight**

represented by **Paul Wooten**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Tracey Edwards**

represented by **Paul Wooten**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Donna Swain**

represented by **Paul Wooten**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Defendant**

**Helena M. Donohue**

**Intervenor Defendant**

**George E. Pataki**

represented by **Fredric S. Newman**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Lt. Governor Mary O. Donohue**

represented by **Fredric S. Newman**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Todd Davis Valentine**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Eliot Spitzer**

represented by **Joel Graber**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Joseph L. Bruno**

represented by **Gregg M Mashberg**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**John Richard Braatz**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Traci Leigh Lovitt**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Sheldon Silver**  
*TERMINATED: 08/09/2002*

represented by **C. Daniel Chill**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 08/09/2002*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Martin E. Connor**  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Neil W. Kelleher**

represented by **Todd Davis Valentine**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Helena M. Donohue**

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Charles Nesbitt**

represented by **Eliot L. Spitzer**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Joel Graber**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Asian American Legal Defense and  
Education Fund**  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*

represented by **Glenn Duque Magpantay**  
Asian American Legal Defense  
99 Hudson Street  
New York, NY 11355  
(212)-966-5932  
Fax: (212)-966-4303  
Email: gmagpantay@aaldef.org  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Kenneth Kimerling**  
Asian American Legal Defense  
99 Hudson Street  
New York, NY 11355  
(212) 966-5932  
Fax: 212 966 4303  
Email: kkimerling@aaldef.org

*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Peter K. Lau**

represented by **Glenn Duque Magpantay**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Kenneth Kimerling**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**John Kuo Wei Tchen**  
*also known as*  
Jack Kuo Wei Tchen

represented by **Glenn Duque Magpantay**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Kenneth Kimerling**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Mindy Kim**

represented by **Glenn Duque Magpantay**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Kenneth Kimerling**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Sachi Dastidar**

represented by **Glenn Duque Magpantay**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Kenneth Kimerling**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Tara Singh**  
*also known as*  
Taracharran Singh

represented by **Glenn Duque Magpantay**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Kenneth Kimerling**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Latino Voting Rights Committee of**

**Metro New York****Movant**

**Christopher Earl Strunk**  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Eric Rodriguez**  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*

represented by **Gregory Charles Soumas**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**James R. Jubilee**  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*

represented by **Gregory Charles Soumas**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Martin Malave-Divan**

represented by **Gregory Charles Soumas**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Puerto Rican Legal Defense and  
Education Fund**  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*

represented by **Foster Maer**  
Puerto Rican Defense & Education  
Fund, Inc.  
99 Hudson Street  
14th Floor  
New York, NY 10013  
(212) 219-3360  
*TERMINATED: 01/24/2003*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Robert A. Radulski**  
*TERMINATED: 08/09/2002*

represented by **Lawrence Arthur Mandelker**  
Kantor, Davidoff, Wolfe, Mandelker,  
Tworney & Gallanty  
51 East 42nd Street  
New York, NY 10017  
(212)-682-8383  
Fax: (212)-949-5206  
Email:  
mandelker@kantorlawonline.com  
*TERMINATED: 08/09/2002*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Bernard T. Kozykowski**

represented by **Lawrence Arthur Mandelker**

*TERMINATED: 08/09/2002*

(See above for address)

*TERMINATED: 08/09/2002*

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Plaintiff**

**Congressman Benjamin A. Gilman**

*TERMINATED: 08/09/2002*

represented by **Lawrence Arthur Mandelker**

(See above for address)

*TERMINATED: 08/09/2002*

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Helena M. Donohue**

**Defendant**

**David A. Paterson**

*Minority Leader of the Senate of the  
State of New York*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Anthony Creaney**

represented by **Nancy R. Sills**

(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Intervenor Defendant**

**Thomas Terry**

represented by **Cassandra Fay Lentchner**

Perkins Coie LLP (DC)

607 Fourteenth Street N.W.

Suite 800

Washington, DC 20005-2003

202-434-1611

Fax: 202-654-9135

Email: clentchner@perkinscoie.com

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Nancy R. Sills**

(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

<b>Date Filed</b>	<b>#</b>	<b>Docket Text</b>
01/25/2002	1	COMPLAINT filed. Summons issued and Notice pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 636 (c). FILING FEE \$ 150.00 RECEIPT # 428318. (gmo) (Entered: 01/31/2002)
01/25/2002		Magistrate Judge Frank Maas is so designated. (gmo) (Entered: 01/31/2002)
02/28/2002	2	NOTICE of appearance by Eliot Spitzer. His undersigned attorney is Joel Graber. (db) (Entered: 03/01/2002)
03/07/2002	3	NOTICE OF MOTION by Howard T. Allen, Jeannette Santos, Donald J. Jirak, Richard Flateau, Charlotte A. Taylor, Mervyn A. Campbell and Sarah

		Brockus (filed on service date) pursuant to Rule 24(a) or, in the alternative, Rule 24(b) of the FRCP, for an Order to intervene in this action as plaintiffs on the grounds that they have an interest in the transactions which are the subject of this action and the disposition of this action may as a practical matter impair or impede their ability to protect those interests unless their interests are adequately represented herein and they are the petitioners in a proceeding commenced in the Supreme Court of the State of New York presenting claims pursuant to New York State Unconsolidated Laws 4221 that raise common questions of law and fact as those raised in the instant action . Return date not indicated. Affidavit of Richard Flateau in support of motion and Proposed Order attached. (yv) (Entered: 03/08/2002)
03/07/2002	4	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Howard T. Allen, Jeannette Santos, Donald J. Jirak, Richard Flateau, Charlotte A. Taylor, Mervyn A. Campbell and Sarah Brockus in support of [3-1] motion pursuant to Rule 24(a) or, in the alternative, Rule 24(b) of the FRCP, for an Order to intervene in this action as plaintiffs on the grounds that they have an interest in the transactions which are the subject of this action and the disposition of this action may as a practical matter impair or impede their ability to protect those interests unless their interests are adequately represented herein and they are the petitioners in a proceeding commenced in the Supreme Court of the State of New York presenting claims pursuant to New York State Unconsolidated Laws 4221 that raise common questions of law and fact as those raised in the instant action . (yv) (Entered: 03/08/2002)
03/15/2002	5	NOTICE OF MOTION (filed on service date) for an order pursuant to FRCP Rule 24(a)(2), or in the alternative, Rule 24(b)(2) allowing proposed inventors to intervene as plaintiffs by Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford . Return date 3/29/02. (bai) (Entered: 03/19/2002)
03/15/2002	6	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford in support of [5-1] motion for an order pursuant to FRCP Rule 24(a)(2), or in the alternative, Rule 24(b)(2) allowing proposed inventors to intervene as plaintiffs by Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford . (bai) (Entered: 03/19/2002)
03/15/2002	7	INTERVENOR'S COMPLAINT by plaintiffs-intervenors against George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, John J. Faso, Martin E. Connor, Carol Berman, Neil W. Kelleher, Evelyn J. Aquila . Summons issued. (bai) (Entered: 03/19/2002)
03/15/2002	8	NOTICE OF MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) for an order granting motion to intervene by Raymond M. Fink, Stephen P. Gocinski, John Quaglione, Patricia Mustaro, Lena Yu, purs. to F.R.C.P. 24(a), or in the alternative, F.R.C.P. 24(b) . Return date 4/5/02. Affidavit of Gayle N. Wolkenberg in support, and proposed verified complaint are attached. (sn) (Entered: 03/19/2002)
03/15/2002	9	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Raymond M. Fink, Stephen P. Gocinski, John Quaglione, Patricia Mustaro, Lena Yu in support of [8-1] motion for an order granting motion to intervene by Raymond M. Fink, Stephen P. Gocinski, John Quaglione, Patricia Mustaro, Lena Yu, purs. to F.R.C.P. 24(a), or in the

		alternative, F.R.C.P. 24(b). (sn) (Entered: 03/19/2002)
03/25/2002	10	NOTICE OF MOTION by Council of Elected, Leslie Barbour, Michelle Romero, William O. Low, Cecilia Guterrez, Evelyn Miller, Seretta C. McKnight, Tracey Edwards, Donna Swain for an Order that they may intervene as plaintiffs in this action as a matter of right pursuant to FRCP 24 (a)(2) or, in the alternative, allowing proposed intervenors permissive intervention as plaintiffs in this matter under FRCP 24(ba)(2) . Return date 3/29/02. Complaint-in-intervention attached. (yv) Modified on 03/28/2002 (Entered: 03/28/2002)
03/25/2002	11	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Council of Elected, Leslie Barbour, Michelle Romero, William O. Low, Cecilia Guterrez, Evelyn Miller, Seretta C. McKnight, Tracey Edwards, Donna Swain in support of [10-1] motion for an Order that they may intervene as plaintiffs in this action as a matter of right pursuant to FRCP 24(a)(2), [10-2] motion allowing proposed intervenors permissive intervention as plaintiffs in this matter under FRCP 24(ba)(2) . (yv) (Entered: 03/28/2002)
03/25/2002	12	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Notice of Motion, complaint and memorandum of law as to Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan, George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, John J. Faso, Martin E. Connor, Berman, Neil W. Kelleher, Evelyn J. Aquila by Federal Express, next day mail on 3/18/02 . . (yv) (Entered: 03/28/2002)
03/25/2002	15	NOTICE OF MOTION by Joseph L. Bruno for an order pursuant to Local Civil Rule 1.3(c) of the F.R.C.P. for Michael A. Carvin, Esq.to appear pro hac vice on behalf of dft. Joseph L. Bruno ; w/ atch. Aff. in support of ; Return date: not indicated. (pl) (Entered: 04/01/2002)
03/25/2002	16	ANSWER to Complaint by Joseph L. Bruno; (Attorney Traci L. Lovitt from the Firm: Jones, Day, Reavis & Pogue). (pl) (Entered: 04/01/2002)
03/27/2002	13	Order admitting Michael A. Carvin to appear as attorney pro hac vice for plfff. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) ; Copies mailed. (orig. forwarded to the Atty Admission Clerk) (sac) (Entered: 03/28/2002)
03/28/2002	14	ANSWER to Complaint by Sheldon Silver (Attorney C. DANiel Chill from the Firm: Graubard, Miller) . (yv) (Entered: 04/01/2002)
03/29/2002	20	NOTICE OF MOTION by Martin E. Connor for an order purs. to Local Civil Rule 1.3(c) admitting H. Reed Witherby pro hac vice for the purpose of representing respondent Martin E. Connor as Minority Leader of the NY State Senate . No return date indicated. Affidavit of Arnold J. Ludwig, and Declaration of H. Reed Witherby in support are attached. (sn) (Entered: 04/05/2002)
03/29/2002		Memo endorsed on motion; granting [20-1] motion for an order purs. to Local Civil Rule 1.3(c) admitting H. Reed Witherby pro hac vice for the purpose of representing respondent Martin E. Connor as Minority Leader of the NY State Senate. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) ; Copies mailed. (Forwarded to Attorney Admissions Clerk) (sn) (Entered: 04/05/2002)

04/01/2002	17	ORDER; a preliminary status conference has been scheduled in this matter for Friday, April 5, 2002 at 2:00p.m. in courtroom 706 of the United States Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, NY, NY. All proposed intervening parties are welcome to attend ; ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (djc) (Entered: 04/02/2002)
04/02/2002	18	ANSWER to Complaint by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue (Attorney Fredric S. Newman from the Firm: Hoguet, Newman & Regal, LLP). (sac) (Entered: 04/03/2002)
04/03/2002	19	ANSWER to Complaint by Mary O. Donohue, Carol Berman, Neil W. Kelleher, Evelyn J. Aquila (Attorney Todd D. Valentine). (moc) (Entered: 04/04/2002)
04/05/2002	21	ANSWER to Complaint by Eliot Spitzer (Attorney Joel Graber from the Firm: Atty Genl NYS) . (cd) (Entered: 04/08/2002)
04/08/2002	22	ORDER; Upon consideration of plaintiffs' request for the appointment of a three-judge district court purs to 28 U.S.C. section 2284(a), which provided that " {a} district court of three judges shall be convened...when an action is filed challenging the constitutionality of the apportionment of congressional districts or the apportionment of any statewide legislative body; Plaintiff's request is granted; A three-judge court of John M. Walker, Jr., Ch. C.J., John G. Koeltl, D.J., and Richard M. Berman, D.J. is convened to hear and determine this action ; (signed by Judge John M. Walker Jr. ); Copies mailed. (djc) (Entered: 04/09/2002)
04/08/2002		Case assigned to panel of Judge Richard M. Berman and Judge John G. Koeltl and Judge John M. Walker Jr. (dcap) (Entered: 08/09/2002)
04/09/2002	23	ANSWER to Complaint by John J. Faso (Attorney Brian J. Clark from the Firm: Clifton Budd & DeMaria, LLP). (kw) (Entered: 04/10/2002)
04/15/2002	24	ORDER granting [10-1] motion for an Order that they may intervene as plaintiffs in this action as a matter of right pursuant to FRCP 24(a)(2), granting [8-1] motion for an order granting motion to intervene by Raymond M. Fink, Stephen P. Gocinski, John Quaglione, Patricia Mustaro, Lena Yu, purs. to F.R.C.P. 24(a), or in the alternative, F.R.C.P. 24(b), granting [5-1] motion for an order pursuant to FRCP Rule 24(a)(2), or in the alternative, Rule 24(b)(2) allowing proposed inventors to intervene as plaintiffs by Sandra Rivers, Rosemary Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford, granting [3-1] motion pursuant to Rule 24(a) or, in the alternative, Rule 24(b) of the FRCP, for an Order to intervene in this action as plaintiffs on the grounds that they have an interest in the transactions which are the subject of this action and the disposition of this action may as a practical matter impair or impede their ability to protect those interests unless their interests are adequately represented herein and they are the petitioners in a proceeding commenced in the Supreme Court of the State of New York presenting claims pursuant to New York State Unconsolidated Laws 4221 that raise common questions of law and fact as those raised in the instant action, set status conference for 2:00 4/22/02,in courtroom 1505 40 Center St., NY NY ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (cd) (Entered: 04/16/2002)

04/23/2002	25	COMPLAINT filed. Summons issued and Notice pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 636 (c). . (yv) (Entered: 04/25/2002)
04/25/2002	26	AMENDED COMPLAINT by Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan, Howard T. Allen, Jeannette Santos, Donald J. Jirak, Richard Flateau, Charlotte A. Taylor, Mervyn A. Campbell, Sarah Brockus (Answer due 5/8/02 for Evelyn J. Aquila, for Neil W. Kelleher, for Carol Berman, for Martin E. Connor, for John J. Faso, for Sheldon Silver, for Joseph L. Bruno, for Eliot Spitzer, for Mary O. Donohue, for George E. Pataki, for Evelyn J. Aquila, for Neil W. Kelleher, for Carol Berman, for Martin E. Connor, for John J. Faso, for Sheldon Silver, for Joseph L. Bruno, for Eliot Spitzer, for Mary O. Donohue, for George E. Pataki ) amending [25-1] complaint ; Summons issued. (bai) (Entered: 04/29/2002)
04/26/2002	27	ORDER; that counsel for the parties are requested forthwith to "meet and confer" (by phone or in person) in order to develop a joint list of 3-6 independent experts, i.e. mutually acceptable, who might assist a Special Master, appointed pursuant to F.R.C.P. 53, in the development of a redistricting plan for the State of New York, dividing the State into twenty-nine congressional districts in accordance with the 2000 federal census and applicable law; because time is of the essence, such joint list, along with the experts' curriculum vitae and credentials, shall be submitted to each of the three-judge court members no later than 4:00 P.m. on Monday, April 29, 2000 . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (pl) (Entered: 04/29/2002)
04/30/2002	28	Notice of Voluntary Dismissal of the complaint of the intervenors-plaintiffs Raymond M. Fink, Stephen P. Gocinski, John Quaglione, Patricia Mustaro, and Lena Yu w/out prejudice, pursuant to Rule 41(a)(1) of the F.R.C.P. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (ae) (Entered: 04/30/2002)
04/30/2002	29	ORDER APPOINTING SPECIAL MASTER, purs to FRCP 53, Frederick B. Lacey is hereby appointed Special Master, as further set forth in this document and the Court requests the Special Master to submit his plan for redistricting to the Court on 5/10/02, or a soon thereafter as he is able to complete a plan that meets the requirements of the law and of this order ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman, John M. Walker, Jr., and John G. Koeltl ); Copies mailed. (cd) Modified on 07/31/2002 (Entered: 05/01/2002)
04/30/2002	30	NOTICE of attorney appearance for Joseph L. Bruno by Gregg M. Mashberg. (bai) (Entered: 05/02/2002)
04/30/2002	31	NOTICE of Filing by Joseph L. Bruno . Re: a letter setting forth his objection to pltf's failure to maintain the Congressional impasse case and the case regarding the newly-enacted Senate plan as district civil actions. (bai) (Entered: 05/02/2002)
05/01/2002	32	AMENDED INTERVENOR'S COMPLAINT by Plaintiff-Intervenors Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Crashaw, Sandra Bradford, Council of Black Elected Democrats, Inc., Leslie Barbour, Michelle Romero, William O. Low, Cecilia Guterrez, Evelyn Miller, Seretta C. McKnight, Tracey Edwards and Donna Swain against George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer,

		Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, John J. Faso, Martin E. Connor, Carol Berman, Neil W. Kelleher, Evelyn J. Aquila , Helena M. Donohue : amending [7-1] intervenor complaint . Summons issued. (yv) (Entered: 05/03/2002)
05/03/2002	33	ORDER, regarding the procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of all letters, documents, motions, applications, etc . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (tp) (Entered: 05/03/2002)
05/09/2002	34	ANSWER TO [26-1] amended complaint by Sheldon Silver (Attorney C. Daniel Chill from the Firm: Graubard Miller). (yv) (Entered: 05/10/2002)
05/10/2002	39	ANSWER by Eliot Spitzer to [32-1] intervenor amended complaint. (Attorney Joel Graber from the Firm: Attorney General of State of New York). (kkc) (Entered: 05/14/2002)
05/10/2002	40	ANSWER by Eliot Spitzer to [26-1] amended complaint. (Attorney Joel Graber from the Firm: Attorney General of State of New York). (kkc) (Entered: 05/14/2002)
05/10/2002	42	ANSWER by Joseph L. Bruno to [26-1] amended complaint. (Attorney Lisa A. Bauer from the Firm: Proskauer Rose, LLP). (kkc) (Entered: 05/15/2002)
05/13/2002	35	Congressional District (3) maps filed by special master Frederick B. Lacey. (tp) (Entered: 05/13/2002)
05/13/2002	36	Executive Summary by special master Frederick B. Lacey, recommending that his Plan be adopted by the Court, as he believes that it meets all required legal standards, and respects important political, geographic, and demographic factors in New York State. (tp) (Entered: 05/13/2002)
05/13/2002	37	REPORT AND PLAN by special master Frederick B. Lacey. Appendix on Support of the Report and Plan is attached. (tp) (Entered: 05/13/2002)
05/13/2002	38	AFFIDAVIT of Bernard N. Grofman in support of [37-1] Report and Plan of special master Frederick Lacey. (tp) (Entered: 05/13/2002)
05/13/2002	41	ORDER; this Order invites public comment (written and oral) on the Report, dated 5/13/02, of the Hon. Frederick B. Lacey, Special Master appointed by the 3-judge Court purs. to an Order, dated 4/26/02, including the Executive Summary of the same date, and the proposed redistricting plan for the State of NY, prepared and submitted by the Special Master along with his Report. The Report and the Plan may be found at the S.D.N.Y. website at <a href="http://www.nysd.uscourts.gov">www.nysd.uscourts.gov</a> . Copies may be obtained at the offices of the Special Master, LeBoeuf, Lamb, Greene & MacRae, L.L.P., 125 W. 55th St., New York, NY 10019, attn: William Primps, tel. (212) 424-8000. Written comments are to be filed by the close of business on 5/16/02, with the Clerk of Court, 500 Pearl St., Rm. 120, New York, NY 10007. Courtesy copies should simultaneously be delivered to the chambers of Chief Judge Walker, 40 Centre St., Rm. 2403, New York, NY 10007, Judge Koeltl, 500 Pearl St, Rm. 1030, New York, NY 10007, and Judge Berman, at 40 Centre St., Rm. 201. The 3-judge Court will convene on 5/20/02 at 2 PM in Courtroom 1505, 40 Centre St., for the purpose of hearing oral presentations from all interested persons with respect to the Report and/or Plan submitted by the Special Master .

		( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (sn) (Entered: 05/15/2002)
05/14/2002	43	ANSWER by Joseph L. Bruno to [32-1] intervenor complaint . (Attorney John R. Braatz, Gregg M. Mashberg from the Firm: Proskauer, Rose, L.L.P.). (db) (Entered: 05/16/2002)
05/14/2002	44	ANSWER by Sheldon Silver to [32-1] intervenor complaint . (Attorney C. DANiel Chill from the Firm: Graubard, Miller). (db) (Entered: 05/16/2002)
05/15/2002	50	AMENDED ANSWER by Sheldon Silver to [26-1] amended complaint . (Attorney C. DANiel Chill from the Firm: Graubard Miller). (bai) (Entered: 05/17/2002)
05/16/2002	45	Letter filed addressed to Judges Walker, Koeltl and Berman from Andrew R. Tulloch, dated 5/15/02, Re: The undersigned represents Congresswoman Carolyn B. Maloney, the incumbent and resident of the current and proposed 14th Congressional Districts in the plan presented before you by the Special Master. As you consider the Report of the Special Master, we would like to make comments specific to the 14th Congressional District of New York as contained in the report as set forth in this letter. (ae) (Entered: 05/16/2002)
05/16/2002	46	ANSWER by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue to [26-1] amended complaint . (Attorney Fredric S. Newman from the Firm: Hogue Newman & Regal,LLP). (rag) (Entered: 05/16/2002)
05/16/2002	47	Filed Comments of Senator Joseph L. Bruno on Special Master's Report and Proposed Redistricting Plan. (rag) (Entered: 05/16/2002)
05/16/2002	57	INTERVENOR'S COMPLAINT by Asian American, Peter K. Lau, John Kuo Wei Tchen, Mindy Kim, Sachi Dastidar, Tara Singh against George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, Charles Nisbitt, Martin E. Connor, Neil W. Kelleher, Helena M. Donohue, Evelyn J. Aquila. Summons issued. (ae) (Entered: 05/20/2002)
05/16/2002	58	Comment on Special Master's Congressional Redistricting Plan by Asian American, Peter K. Lau, John Kuo Wei Tchen, Mindy Kim, Sachi Dastidar, Tara Singh. (ae) (Entered: 05/20/2002)
05/16/2002	61	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Glenn D. Magpantay, dated 5/14/02. Re: Asian American Legal Defense and Education Fund seek to intervene. AALDEF is welcome to the case. Please coordinate closely with plaintiffs' and other intervenors' counsel. We are having a hearing on Special Master Lacey's Plan on 5/20/02 at 2:00 p.m. in Room 1505, 40 Centre Street . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 05/23/2002)
05/17/2002	48	Letter filed addressed to Judge Berman from Robert Allan Muir, Jr., dated 5/16/02, re: Vito J. Fossella and the basis to maintain the 13th Congressional District in its present form. (cd) (Entered: 05/17/2002)
05/17/2002	49	Letter filed addressed to Judge Berman from Elaine M. Reich, dated 5/16/02, re NY State Assembly's position on the Special Master's plan (cd) (Entered: 05/17/2002)

05/17/2002	51	AFFIDAVIT of David Pollock Re: Jewish Community Relations Council's position on the Special Master's Plan and proposed changes (cd) (Entered: 05/17/2002)
05/17/2002	59	ORDER. The hearing will be held in Courtroom 1705 (not Courtroom 1505) at 40 Centre Street, the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse ; (signed by Judge Richard M. Berman); Copies mailed. (djc) (Entered: 05/21/2002)
05/17/2002	60	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Alan Levine, dated 5/15/02. Re: Puerto Rican Legal Defense and Education Fund seek a pre-motion conference concerning their motion pursuant to Rule 24 of the F.R.C.P. for intervention as plaintiffs on behalf of the Latino Voting Rights Committee of Metro New York and Individual Latino voters; counsel's comments have been received & will be considered as part of the record. Formal intervention motion not necessary but counsel is requested to converse existing parties & set forth FRCP 24 basis for intervention. Counsel & PRLDF are welcome to 5/20/02 hearing . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (pl) (Entered: 05/22/2002)
05/20/2002	52	Letter filed addressed to Clerk of Court from Benjamin A. Gilman, Member of Congress from the 20th District New York dated 5/15/02, re: Redistricting. (rag) Modified on 05/20/2002 (Entered: 05/20/2002)
05/20/2002	53	Letter filed addressed to Hon. Frederick B. Lacey from Maurice D. Hinchey, Congress of the United States - House of Representatives from the 26th District New York - dated 5/15/02, re: Redistricting. (rag) (Entered: 05/20/2002)
05/20/2002	54	Letter filed addressed to Clerk of Court from Abraham Wieder, Mayor - Village of Kiryas Joel dated 5/15/02, re: Redistricting. (rag) (Entered: 05/20/2002)
05/20/2002	55	Letter filed addressed to Clerk of Court from Ehsan M. Rahman, Vice Pres. American Bangladesh Friendship Society, dated 5/15/02, re: Redistricting. (rag) (Entered: 05/20/2002)
05/20/2002	56	Letter filed Rep. LaFalce's Testimony in Response to Special Master Lacey's Congressional Redistricting Plan. (rag) (Entered: 05/20/2002)
05/21/2002	62	DUMBO-FULTON FERRY LANDING, VINEGAR HILL Neighborhood History Guide by Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan, Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford, Council of Elected, Leslie Barbour, Michelle Romero, William O. Low, Cecilia Guterrez, Evelyn Miller, Seretta C. McKnight, Tracey Edwards, Donna Swain, Latino Voting Rights. (db) (Entered: 05/24/2002)
05/21/2002	63	Letter filed by Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan, Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford, Council of Elected, Leslie Barbour, Michelle Romero, William O. Low, Cecilia Guterrez, Evelyn Miller, Seretta C. McKnight, Tracey Edwards, Donna Swain, Latino Voting Rights addressed to clerk of court from Jacques O. D'i. Michel, dated 5/20/02, re: directives of proposed plan in question (in above action). (db) (Entered: 05/24/2002)

05/21/2002	64	Plaintiffs' comments to the THREE-JUDGE COURT concerning the Special Masters Proposed Congressional Redistricting Plan by Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan, Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford, Council of Elected, Leslie Barbour, Michelle Romero, William O. Low, Cecilia Guterrez, Evelyn Miller, Seretta C. McKnight, Tracey Edwards, Donna Swain, Latino Voting Rights. (db) (Entered: 05/24/2002)
05/21/2002	65	Letter filed by Farmers of Orange County addressed to clerk of court from Eve L. Pawelski, dated 5/16/02, re: Special Masters proposal for Congressional District 20. (db) (Entered: 05/24/2002)
05/21/2002	66	Letter filed by National Council of Young Israel addressed to clerk of court from Rabbi Pesach Lerner, dated 5/20/02, re: Special Masters proposal for Congressional District 20. (db) (Entered: 05/24/2002)
05/21/2002	67	Letter filed by Per-Olof Odman addressed to Judge Berman from Per-Olof Odman, dated 5/20/02, re: public comment on Special Master proposed 12th Congressional District. (db) (Entered: 05/24/2002)
05/21/2002	68	Photocopy of New York Times article regarding Special Master proposed redistricting hearings and historical background of proposed areas. (db) (Entered: 05/24/2002)
05/21/2002	69	Letter filed by Assembly of Task Force on Redistricting addressed to Judge Berman from C. Daniel Chill, dated 5/21/02, re: supplemental submission re: Special Master proposal for District 23. (db) (Entered: 05/24/2002)
05/23/2002	70	ANSWER by James R. Jubilee, Mary O. Donohue to [32-1] intervenors' amended complaint Firm of: Hoguet, Newman & Regal, LLP by attorney Fredric S. Newman for intervenor-defendant Mary O. Donohue (moc) (Entered: 05/28/2002)
05/24/2002	71	OPINION AND ORDER #86986; that this action, sought delcaratory and injunctive relief against use of New York State's existing state legislative and Congressional districts in the forthcoming 2002 elections. Among other things, the Complaints and Amended Complaints ask this Court to intervene to ensure that Congressional district lines are drawn in time for the fair and orderly conduct of the primary and general elections to be held in 2002; to help ensure the fair, orderly and lawful election of Members of Congress from New York State, this three-judge court hereby adopts in its entirety the Report of Special Master Frederick B. Lacey submitted on 5/13/02, including its proposed redistricting Plan (the "Special Master's Plan" or the "Lacey Plan") dividing the State into 29 Congressional districts based upon the 2000 census. The Special Master's Plan complies with the Voting Rights Act of 1965, as amended in 1970, 1975, and 1982, 42 U.S.C. sections 1973, et seq. and the Constitutions of the United States and the State of New York . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman, Judge John G. Koeltl and Judge John M. Walker, Jr. Chief Circuit Judge ); Copies mailed. (pl) (Entered: 05/29/2002)
06/05/2002	82	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Richard D. Emery, dated 06/03/02; Re: counsel to plaintiffs request a pre-motion conference to make a motion to enjoin preliminarily defendants as set forth in

		this correspondence; Defendants to submit joint letter response by 06/04/02 ; ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (dj) (Entered: 06/10/2002)
06/06/2002	72	Letter filed addressed to Justice Lacey from Pamela Lydic, dated 5/15/02, re: Federal Congressional redistricting map. (rag) (Entered: 06/06/2002)
06/06/2002	73	Letter filed addressed to Justice Lacey from Esmeralda Simmons,Esq., dated 5/15/02, re: Congressional District Plan. (rag) (Entered: 06/06/2002)
06/06/2002	74	Letter filed addressed to Judges Walker, Koeltl,Berman from Rabbi Simcha Krauss, dated 5/16/02, re: Congressional Redistricting Map. (rag) (Entered: 06/06/2002)
06/06/2002	75	Letter filed addressed to Judges Walker,Koeltl,Berman from Rabbi Fabian Schenfeld, Re: Congressional Redistricting Plan. (rag) (Entered: 06/06/2002)
06/06/2002	76	Letter filed addressed to Clerk of Court from Rep. Gregory Meeks, dated 5/16/02, re: Congressional Redistricting Plan . (rag) (Entered: 06/06/2002)
06/06/2002	77	Letter filed addressed to Justice Lacey from Nydia M. Velazquez, dated 5/16/02, re: Congressional Redistricting Plan. (rag) (Entered: 06/06/2002)
06/06/2002	78	Letter filed addressed to Justice Lacey from Maurice D. Hinchey, dated 5/21/02, re: Congressional Redistricting Plan. (rag) (Entered: 06/06/2002)
06/06/2002	79	Letter filed addressed to Judges Walker, Berman, Koeltl from Glenn D. Magpantay, dated 5/22/02, re: Congressional Redistricting Plan. (rag) (Entered: 06/06/2002)
06/06/2002	80	Letter filed addressed to Judges Walker, Berman, Koeltl from Paul Wooten, dated 5/21/02, re: Congressional Redistricting Plan. (rag) (Entered: 06/06/2002)
06/06/2002	81	Letter filed addressed to Judges Walker,Berman,Koeltl from Paul Wooten, dated 5/22/02, re: Congressional Redistricting Plan. (rag) (Entered: 06/06/2002)
06/07/2002	83	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from John R. Braatz, C. Daniel Chill, Ira J. Lipton, dated 6/5/02 Re: reapportionment plan: I'm sure we'll try and work it into the 6/11/02 agenda along with plntf's application, etc. All parties please be prepared to address issues of timing, timetables, scheduling of substantive and procedural steps ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (cd) (Entered: 06/11/2002)
06/07/2002	85	Transcript of record of proceedings before Chief Judge John M. Walker of the Second Circuit, Judge Richard M. Berman and Judge John G. Koeltl for the date(s) of 4/22/02 at 2:10 p.m. (ph) (Entered: 06/11/2002)
06/07/2002	86	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Walker, Berman & Koeltl from Esmeralda Simmons, dated 06/05/02; Re: Plaintiff-intervenors requests that the Court grant plaintiffs' application for a pre-motion conference; Coordinate closely (jointly) with plaintiffs who are contemplating a similar application ; ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (dj)

		Modified on 06/14/2002 (Entered: 06/13/2002)
06/10/2002	88	ANSWER by Joseph L. Bruno to [57-1] intervenor complaint Firm of: Proskauer, Rose, L.L.P. by attorney Gregg M. Mashberg for intervenor-defendant Joseph L. Bruno, John R. Braatz for intervenor-defendant Joseph L. Bruno (db) (Entered: 06/17/2002)
06/10/2002	89	ANSWER by Eliot Spitzer to [57-1] intervenor complaint Firm of: by attorney Joel Graber for intervenor-defendant Eliot Spitzer (db) (Entered: 06/17/2002)
06/11/2002	84	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Richard M. Berman for the date(s) of 4/5/02 at 2:00 p.m. (ph) (Entered: 06/11/2002)
06/13/2002	87	ORDER; that the next conference will be held on Wednesday, 6/19/02 at 4:00 p.m. (not 2:00 p.m.), in Courtroom 1505 of the Thurgood Marshall U.S. Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, N.Y.C. 10007 ; counsel are requested to "meet and confer" forthwith to ascertain whether applications/motions are opposed or consented to (and to so indicate in their moving papers) and to ascertain whether applications/motions or responses can be submitted jointly ; counsel are requested to comply with Judge Berman's Individual Practices with respect, amount things, to motions, pages limits, margins, etc ; deadline for filing of all motions by 6/18/02; response to motion deadline 6/25/02; reply to response to motion deadline 6/27/02; three courtesy copies of each motion, response, reply, etc, should be hand delivered to chamber of Judge Berman . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (pl) (Entered: 06/14/2002)
06/13/2002	90	NOTICE OF MOTION by Joseph L. Bruno for an Order, withdrawing the legislative reapportionment plan for the New York State Congressional districts established by Special Master Frederick B. Lacey and adopted by the Court by Order dated 5/23/02 . Return Date not indicated. (tp) (Entered: 06/17/2002)
06/13/2002	91	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Joseph L. Bruno in support of his [90-1] motion for an Order, withdrawing the legislative reapportionment plan for the York State Congressional districts established by Special Master Frederick B. Lacey and adopted by the Court by Order dated 5/23/02. (tp) (Entered: 06/17/2002)
06/13/2002	92	DECLARATION of John R. Braatz by Joseph L. Bruno, Joseph L. Bruno, Joseph L. Bruno in support Re: [90-1] motion for an Order, withdrawing the legislative reapportionment plan for the New York State Congressional districts established by Special Master Frederick B. Lacey and adopted by the Court by Order dated 5/23/02. (tp) (Entered: 06/17/2002)
06/14/2002	93	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue in support of [90-1] motion for an Order, withdrawing the legislative reapportionment plan for the New York State Congressional districts established by Special Master Frederick B. Lacey and adopted by the Court by Order dated 5/23/02 . (db) (Entered: 06/18/2002)
06/14/2002	102	ANSWER by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue to [57-1] intervenor complaint Firm of: Hoguet Newman & Regal, LLP by attorney Fredric S.

		Newman for intervenor-defendant Mary O. Donohue (sb) (Entered: 06/21/2002)
06/17/2002	94	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Daniel Simonette, dated 06/13/02; Re: counsel to proposed plaintiff intervenors requests permission to move to intervene purs to the Court's June 12, 2002 court order; Request to move granted. See Order dated 06/12/02 (attached) please meet and confer with other counsel to avoid duplication and be current with case developments ; ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (djc) (Entered: 06/19/2002)
06/17/2002	95	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan in opposition to [90-1] motion for an Order, withdrawing the legislative reapportionment plan for the New York State Congressional districts established by Special Master Frederick B. Lacey and adopted by the Court by Order dated 5/23/02. (db) (Entered: 06/19/2002)
06/17/2002	96	DECLARATION of Henry T. Berger by Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan in opposition Re: [90-1] motion for an Order, withdrawing the legislative reapportionment plan for the New York State Congressional districts established by Special Master Frederick B. Lacey and adopted by the Court by Order dated 5/23/02 . (db) (Entered: 06/19/2002)
06/17/2002	97	AFFIDAVIT of Elaine M. Reich by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, John J. Faso, Martin E. Connor, Carol Berman, Neil W. Kelleher, Evelyn J. Aquila in support of [90-1] motion for an Order, withdrawing the legislative reapportionment plan for the New York State Congressional districts established by Special Master Frederick B. Lacey and adopted by the Court by Order dated 5/23/02 . (db) (Entered: 06/19/2002)
06/17/2002	99	NOTICE OF MOTION by Minority Leader of the Assembly of New York; for an order pursuant to Local Civil Rule 1.4, permitting the substitution of Eliot Spitzer, Atty. Gen. of the State of New York, as attorney-of-record for the Minority Leader of the Assembly of the State of New York, in place of the firm of Clifton Budd DeMaria, LLP ; for an order pursuant to Rule 25(d)(1) of the F.R.C.P., directing the Clerk of the Court to substitute the name of the present Assembly Minority Leader for that of this predecessor-in-office in the within captioned ; w/ attch. decla. in support of Joel Graber; Return Date; not indicated. (pl) (Entered: 06/20/2002)
06/17/2002	100	NOTICE OF MOTION (filed on service date); for an order granting movant permission to Intervene as a plaintiff for relief as a registered non-enrolled eligible voter in this action pursuant to Rule 19 and 23(a) of the F.R.C.P. ; w/ attch. aff. in support; Return Date 6/25/02 (pl) (Entered: 06/20/2002)
06/17/2002	106	ORDER; that accordingly, pursuant to Rule 53 of the F.R.C.P., Special Master Frederick B. Lacey is hereby directed to review the legal issues relating to redistricting plans for the N.Y.S. Senate and Assembly and to render reports and/or plans, as we may determine are needed, to this Court ; the Special Master is authorized to retain appropriate assistants and experts, as may be reasonably necessary for him to accomplish his task ; the N.Y.S. Legislative

		Task Force on Demographic Research and Reapportionment is respectfully directed to assist the Special Master and his staff by providing to him access, support and staffing on a confidential basis together with any additional assistance that will facilitate and expedite the work of the Special Master ; in performing his work, the Special Master shall review any proposals, plans and comments submitted or developed by all parties and intervenors in actions 02cv618 and 02cv3843. All reasonable costs and expenses of the Special Master, including reasonable compensation to the Speckal Master, his law and any expert advisers and assistants he may retain, subject to approval of this Court, be paid by the State of New York . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (pl) Modified on 06/25/2002 (Entered: 06/25/2002)
06/18/2002	98	ORDER denying, without prejudice as premature [90-1] motion for an Order, withdrawing the legislative reapportionment plan for the New York State Congressional districts established by Special Master Frederick B. Lacey and adopted by the Court by Order dated 5/23/02; defts are directed forthwith to consult with Justice Dept official to seek to expedite preclearance of the State Plan and any remedial state action that may be required by the Justice Dept ; the state petitioning process, scheduled to commence on 6/18/02, is hereby enjoined until further notice from this Court. The parties should be prepared to discuss appropriate measures to implement a revised petitioning timetable with the Court on 6/19/02 ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman, John M. Walker, Jr., and John G. Koeltl ); Copies mailed; also docketed in 01 cv 3843 (cd) Modified on 07/31/2002 (Entered: 06/19/2002)
06/18/2002	101	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Christopher Earl Strunk in support of [100-1] motion for an order granting movant permission to Intervene as a plaintiff for relief as a registered non-enrolled eligible voter in this action pursuant to Rule 19 and 23(a) of the F.R.C.P. . (pl) (Entered: 06/20/2002)
06/19/2002	103	INTERVENOR'S COMPLAINT by Puerto Rican Legal against Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan . Summons issued. (pl) (Entered: 06/24/2002)
06/19/2002	104	NOTICE OF MOTION by Robert A. Radulski, Bernard T. Kozykowski, Benjamin A. Gilman; for an order pursuant to F.R.C. P. 24 granting leave to intervene by Robert A. Radulski, Bernard T. Kozykowski, Benjamin A. Gilman ; w/ attch. aff. in support of Lawrence A. Mandelker; Return Date: not indicated. (pl) (Entered: 06/24/2002)
06/19/2002	105	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Robert A. Radulski, Bernard T. Kozykowski, Benjamin A. Gilman in support of [104-1] motion for an order pursuant to F.R.C. P. 24 granting leave to intervene by Robert A. Radulski, Bernard T. Kozykowski, Benjamin A. Gilman . (pl) (Entered: 06/24/2002)
06/19/2002	107	Letter filed by Sheldon Silver addressed to Judge Berman from C. Daniel Chill, dated 6/18/02, re: to request clarification of the Court's Order of 6/17/02. (moc) (Entered: 06/25/2002)
06/20/2002	108	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Notice of Motion and supporting papers by Federal Express on 6/17/02. (moc) (Entered: 06/25/2002)
06/20/2002	133	Letter filed by proposed intervenors Slaughter, et al addressed to Judge

		Berman from Thomas A. Fink, dated 6/17/02, re: position of the proposed intervenors to the motion of the defendant Bruno. (db) (Entered: 07/17/2002)
06/21/2002	109	Letter filed by Andrew Cuomo and the Andrew Cuomo for Govenor campaign addressed to Chief Judge Walker and Judges Koeltl and Berman from Steven C. Russo, dated 6/18/02, re: Court's June 17, 2002 Order. (yv) (Entered: 06/26/2002)
06/24/2002	110	ANSWER by Martin E. Connor to [26-1] amended complaint, [32-1] intervenor complaint . (Attorney H. Reed Witherby, Arnold J. Ludwig). (yv) Modified on 06/26/2002 (Entered: 06/26/2002)
06/24/2002	111	ANSWER by Martin E. Connor to [26-1] amended complaint . (Attorney Arnold J. Ludwig, H. Reed Witherby). (yv) (Entered: 06/26/2002)
06/25/2002	112	ANSWER by Sheldon Silver to [57-1] intervenor complaint Firm of: Graubard Miller by attorney C. DANIEL Chill for intervenor-defendant Sheldon Silver (sb) (Entered: 06/28/2002)
06/25/2002	113	AFFIDAVIT of C. Daniel Chill by Sheldon Silver in response to [104-1] motion for an order pursuant to F.R.C. P. 24 granting leave to intervene by Robert A. Radulski, Bernard T. Kozykowski, Benjamin A. Gilman, [100-1] motion for an order granting movant permission to Intervene as a plaintiff for relief as a registered non-enrolled eligible voter in this action pursuant to Rule 19 and 23(a) of the F.R.C.P. . (sb) (Entered: 06/28/2002)
06/25/2002	114	DECLARATION of Richard D. Emery by Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan Re: [104-1] motion for an order pursuant to F.R.C. P. 24 granting leave to intervene by Robert A. Radulski, Bernard T. Kozykowski, Benjamin A. Gilman, [100-1] motion for an order granting movant permission to Intervene as a plaintiff for relief as a registered non-enrolled eligible voter in this action pursuant to Rule 19 and 23(a) of the F.R.C.P. . (sb) (Entered: 06/28/2002)
06/25/2002	115	DECLARATION of John R. Braatz by Joseph L. Bruno Re: [104-1] motion for an order pursuant to F.R.C. P. 24 granting leave to intervene by Robert A. Radulski, Bernard T. Kozykowski, Benjamin A. Gilman, [100-1] motion for an order granting movant permission to Intervene as a plaintiff for relief as a registered non-enrolled eligible voter in this action pursuant to Rule 19 and 23 (a) of the F.R.C.P. . (sb) (Entered: 06/28/2002)
06/27/2002	116	ORDER, the Court having been advised that the 2002 Congressional Plan enacted by the NYS Legislature has today been "pre-cleared" by the US Dept fo Justice. Accordingly, we hereby order the immediate withdrawal of the Congressional Plan prepared by Special Master Frederick B. Lacey and adopted by this Court on 5/23/02. We also hereby dissolve the injunction issued by this Court on 6/17/02 prohibiting petitioning under the State Plan ( signed by Chief Judge John M. Walker, Judge John G. Koeltl, Judge Richard M. Berman, John M. Walker Jr., and John G. Koeltl ); Copies mailed; also docketed in 02 cv 3843 (cd) Modified on 07/31/2002 (Entered: 07/01/2002)
06/27/2002	117	AFFIDAVIT of C. Daniel Chill by Sheldon Silver in opposition to [104-1] motion for an order pursuant to F.R.C. P. 24 granting leave to intervene by

		Robert A. Radulski, Bernard T. Kozykowski, Benjamin A. Gilman . (moc) (Entered: 07/02/2002)
06/28/2002	119	ANSWER by Martin E. Connor to [57-1] intervenor complaint Firm of: Arnold J. Ludwig, Esq. & H. Reed Witherby, Esq. (sac) (Entered: 07/08/2002)
06/28/2002	120	NOTICE of attorney appearance for Martin E. Connor by Arnold J. Ludwig, Esq. (sac) (Entered: 07/08/2002)
06/28/2002	121	NOTICE of attorney appearance for Martin E. Connor by H. Reed Witherby, Esq. (sac) (Entered: 07/08/2002)
06/28/2002	122	ANSWER by Martin E. Connor to [32-1] intervenor complaint by attorney Arnold J. Ludwig, Esq. & H. Reed Witherby, Esq. (sac) (Entered: 07/08/2002)
06/28/2002	123	ANSWER by Martin E. Connor to [103-1] intervenor complaint Firm of: Arnold J. Ludwig, Esq. & H. Reed Witherby, Esq. (sac) (Entered: 07/08/2002)
06/28/2002	124	NOTICE OF MOTION (filed on service date) by Robert A. Radulski, Bernard T. Kozykowski, Benjamin A. Gilman for preliminary injunction to maintain the Court's redistricting plan in place for the 2002 elections Return Date 4/5/02 at 2:00. (djc) Modified on 07/08/2002 (Entered: 07/08/2002)
07/01/2002	118	ORDER, that motions to be served and filed by 7/3/02 (2:30 p.m.); Representatives Gilman, Slaughter, LaFalce and their co-plaintiffs, etc. are required to meet and confer forthwith and to submit joint filings where possible; Responses to be served and filed by 7/12/02 (4:00 p.m.); responding parties to meet and confer forthwith to submit joint filings where possible; Replies, if any, to be served and filed by 7/15/02 (4:00 p.m.); Courtesy copies of all filings to be simultaneously delivered to the chambers of Chief Judge Walker, 157 Church Street, New Haven, CT 06510, Judge Koeltl, 500 Pearl Street, Rm. 1030, New York, NY 10007, and Judge Berman, 40 Centre Street, Rm. 201, New York, NY 10007 . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (tp) Modified on 07/08/2002 (Entered: 07/03/2002)
07/01/2002	125	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Robert A. Radulski, Bernard T. Kozykowski, Benjamin A. Gilman in support of [124-1] motion for preliminary injunction to maintain the Court's redistricting plan in place for the 2002 elections . (djc) (Entered: 07/08/2002)
07/03/2002	126	VERIFIED SUPPLEMENT TO THE COMPLAINT by Christopher Earl Strunk (Answer due 7/16/02 for Martin Malave-Divan, for James R. Jubilee, for Eric Rodriguez, for Charles Nesbitt, for Helena M. Donohue, for Neil W. Kelleher, for Martin E. Connor, for Sheldon Silver, for Joseph L. Bruno, for Eliot Spitzer, for Mary O. Donohue, for George E. Pataki, for Helena M. Donohue, for Evelyn J. Aquila, for Neil W. Kelleher, for Carol Berman, for Martin E. Connor, for John J. Faso, for Sheldon Silver, for Joseph L. Bruno, for Eliot Spitzer, for Mary O. Donohue, for George E. Pataki, for Evelyn J. Aquila, for Neil W. Kelleher, for Carol Berman, for Martin E. Connor, for John J. Faso, for Sheldon Silver, for Joseph L. Bruno, for Eliot Spitzer, for Mary O. Donohue, for George E. Pataki ) ; Summons issued. (dle) (Entered: 07/12/2002)

07/03/2002	127	NOTICE OF MOTION (filed on service date) by Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan for an order reducing the signature requirement for congressional candidates for the 2002 elections to the lesser of 4% of enrolled voters of the political party whose nomination is sought or 1000 signatures . Return Date 7/15/02 at 0:00. (dle) (Entered: 07/12/2002)
07/03/2002	128	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Robert A. Radulski, Bernard T. Kozykowski, Benjamin A. Gilman in support of [124-1] motion for preliminary injunction to maintain the Court's redistricting plan in place for the 2002 elections . (dle) (Entered: 07/12/2002)
07/03/2002	139	INTERVENOR'S COMPLAINT by Benjamin A. Gilman, Robert A. Radulski, and Bernard T. Kozykowski against George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, Martin E. Connor, Charles Nesbitt, Carol Berman, Neil W. Kelleher, Evelyn J. Aquila, Helena M. Donohue. Summons issued. (ae) (Entered: 07/25/2002)
07/12/2002	129	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Richard Emery, dated 7/10/02; reset scheduling order deadlines: Deadline for filing of all motions by 4/30/03; Response to motion deadline 5/21/03; Reply to response to motion deadline 5/28/03. The schedule is adopted with these provisions: (i) defts proposal re: expert submissions is adopted and plttfs may rebut by 3/14/03; (ii) proposed motions are subject to advanced letter application to the Court; & (iii) proceedings, motions, etc. are to be consolidated (joint), there has been slippage in this area . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (jp) (Entered: 07/16/2002)
07/12/2002	134	AMENDED INTERVENOR'S COMPLAINT by Asian American, Peter K. Lau, John Kuo Wei Tchen, Mindy Kim, Sachi Dastidar, Tara Singh, Puerto Rican Legal: amending [57-1] intervenor complaint. Summons issued. (djc) (Entered: 07/17/2002)
07/12/2002	135	Joint MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Joseph L. Bruno, George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Sheldon Silver in opposition to [127-1] motion for an order reducing the signature requirement for congressional candidates for the 2002 elections to the lesser of 4% of enrolled voters of the political party nomination is sought or 1000 signatures. (djc) (Entered: 07/17/2002)
07/12/2002	136	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver in opposition to [124-1] motion for preliminary injunction to maintain the Court's redistricting plan in place for the 2002 elections. (djc) (Entered: 07/17/2002)
07/12/2002	137	NOTICE of Filing of Letter to the Court, dated July 12, 2002; (djc) (Entered: 07/17/2002)
07/12/2002	138	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of mail on 7/12/02 to the counsel of record as indicated. (djc) (Entered: 07/18/2002)
07/15/2002	130	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Robert A. Radulski, Bernard T. Kozykowski, Benjamin A. Gilman in further support of [124-1] motion for preliminary injunction to maintain the Court's plan in place for the 2002 elections. (db) (Entered: 07/17/2002)

07/15/2002	131	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of reply memorandum as to Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan, George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, John J. Faso, Martin E. Connor, Carol Berman, Neil W. Kelleher, Evelyn J. Aquila, Howard T. Allen, Jeannette Santos, Donald J. Jirak, Richard Flateau, Charlotte A. Taylor, Mervyn A. Campbell, Sarah Brockus, Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford, George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, John J. Faso, Martin E. Connor, Carol Berman, Neil W. Kelleher, Evelyn J. Aquila, Raymond M. Fink, Stephen P. Gocinski, John Quaglione, Patricia Mustaro, Lena Yu, Council of Elected, Leslie Barbour, Michelle Romero, William O. Low, Cecilia Guterrez, Evelyn Miller, Seretta C. McKnight, Tracey Edwards, Donna Swain, Helena M. Donohue, Frederick B. Lacey, Asian American, Peter K. Lau, John Kuo Wei Tchen, Mindy Kim, Sachi Dastidar, Tara Singh, George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, Martin E. Connor, Neil W. Kelleher, Helena M. Donohue, Charles Nesbitt, Latino Voting Rights, Christopher Earl Strunk, Puerto Rican Legal, Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan by federal express on 7/13/02. (db) (Entered: 07/17/2002)
07/15/2002	132	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan in support of [127-1] motion for an order reducing the signature requirement for congressional candidates for the 2002 elections to the lesser of 4% of enrolled voters of political party whose nomination is sought or 1000 signatures. (db) (Entered: 07/17/2002)
07/23/2002	140	ORDER, that there will be a conference/hearing on all pending motions on Thursday, 7/25/02 at 10:30 a.m. in Courtroom 1505 of the Thurgood Marshall U.S. Courthouse, 40 Centre Street . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (dle) (Entered: 07/26/2002)
07/25/2002	141	ANSWER by Sheldon Silver to [139-1] intervenor complaint Firm of: Graubard Miller by attorney C. DANiel Chill for intervenor-defendant Sheldon Silver (yv) (Entered: 07/29/2002)
07/25/2002	142	ANSWER by Sheldon Silver to [134-1] intervenor complaint Firm of: Graubard Miller by attorney C. DANiel Chill for intervenor-defendant Sheldon Silver (yv) (Entered: 07/29/2002)
07/25/2002	146	OPINION AND ORDER #87204, that for the reasons set forth, the Court is denying the [124-1] motion for preliminary injunction to maintain the Court's plan in place for the 2002 elections. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman, John M. Walker, John G. Koeltl ); Copies mailed. (tp) Modified on 08/12/2002 (Entered: 08/09/2002)
07/26/2002	143	ORDER, as stated during the conference held on 7/25/02, Christopher Earl Strunk's Verified Supplement to the Complaint dated 7/1/02, will be treated as a motion to amend his complaint; any (joint) opposition is due (served and filed) on 8/5/02; and reply papers from Mr. Strunk, if any, are due (served and filed) on 8/12/02 . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 07/30/2002)

08/01/2002	147	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge John M. Walker, (Chief Judge of the Second Circuit) and Judge Richard M. Berman and Judge John G. Koeltl for the date(s) of 6/28/02 at 11:10 a.m. (ph) Modified on 08/12/2002 (Entered: 08/12/2002)
08/05/2002	144	ANSWER by Joseph L. Bruno to [134-1] intervenor complaint . (Attorney John Richard Braatz from the Firm: Proskauer Rose LLP). (sac) (Entered: 08/08/2002)
08/06/2002	148	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Notice of Voluntary Dismissal as to defts by mail on 7/31/02. (sac) Modified on 08/12/2002 (Entered: 08/12/2002)
08/06/2002	151	NOTICE OF MOTION (filed in service date) by Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford, Council of Elected, Leslie Barbour, Michelle Romero, William O. Low, Cecilia Evelyn Miller, Seretta C. McKnight, Tracey Edwards, Donna Swain; for an order purs. to Rule 15(a) granting plaintiffs-intervenors Sandra Rivers et al. permission to serve a Second Amended Complaint . No Return Date. (gf) Modified on 08/13/2002 (Entered: 08/13/2002)
08/07/2002	145	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge John M. Walker Jr., Chief Judge of the Second Circuit and Judges Richard M. Berman and John G. Koeltl for the date(s) of 6/11/02. (ja) Modified on 08/09/2002 (Entered: 08/09/2002)
08/09/2002	149	Notice of Voluntary Dismissal pursuant to Rule 41(a)(1) of the F.R.C.P. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (dle) Modified on 08/12/2002 (Entered: 08/12/2002)
08/09/2002	150	STIPULATION AND ORDER of voluntary dismissal of the action, as to plntf-intervenors, Benjamin Gilman, Robert Radulski, and Bernard Kozykowski and deflt Sheldon Silver as Speaker of the Assembly ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (cd) (Entered: 08/13/2002)
08/09/2002	152	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford in support of [151-1] motion for an order purs. to Rule 15(a) granting plaintiffs-intervenors Sandra Rivers et al. permission to serve a Second Amended Complaint . (gf) (Entered: 08/13/2002)
08/09/2002	153	DECLARATION of Joan P. Gibbs by Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford in support Re: [151-1] motion for an order purs. to Rule 15(a) granting plaintiffs-intervenors Sandra Rivers et al. permission to serve a Second Amended Complaint . (gf) (Entered: 08/13/2002)
08/12/2002	154	Letter filed by Christopher Earl Strunk addressed to Judge Berman, dated 8/11/02; Re: replying to the Asst. Atty General's Memo opposing Intervention. (sac) (Entered: 08/15/2002)
08/12/2002	155	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of 21 copies of the Movant Intervenor Reply to AAG Declaration and Law Memorandum Opposing Strunk Intervention by serving the following listed in this document on 8/11/02. (sac) (Entered: 08/15/2002)

08/12/2002	156	AFFIDAVIT by Christopher Earl Strunk in reply to Atty General's Memo of Law and Declaration opposing Strunk Intervention. (sac) (Entered: 08/15/2002)
08/18/2002	163	NOTICE of Filing by Charles Nesbitt, of the annexed Letter to the Court, dated 9/13/02. (sac) (Entered: 09/24/2002)
08/28/2002	157	ANSWER to Complaint by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue (Attorney Ira J. Lipton from the Firm: Hoguet, Newman & Regal, LLP) . (gf) (Entered: 08/30/2002)
08/30/2002	159	Initial disclosure pursuant to Rule 26(a) of the FRCP by Sheldon Silver. (db) (Entered: 09/06/2002)
09/03/2002	158	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Richard M. Berman, Judge John M. Walker, Jr. and before Judge John G. Koeltl for the date(s) of July 25, 2002. (jw) (Entered: 09/03/2002)
09/16/2002	160	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Walker, Judge Berman and Judge Koeltl from Joan P. Gibbs, dated 9/9/02. Re: counsel for plttf-intervenors inquire as to the status of pltf-intv motion for leave to file an amended complaint on 8/7/02. Pltf-intv's believe that a scheduling order for responses and replies to plttf-intv's or an in-court or telephone conference with counsel is warranted. granting [151-1] motion for an order purs. to Rule 15(a) granting plaintiffs-intervenors Sandra Rivers et al. permission to serve a Second Amended Complaint. The Court considers the motion granted. The amended complaint should be filed and served forthwith, if it has not already been. (signed by Judge M. Berman); Copies mailed. (db) (Entered: 09/17/2002)
09/18/2002	161	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Joel Graber, dated 9/13/02. Re: defendants request an extension of time to respond to the fee applications of Judge Frederick B. Lacey and Kenneth J. Bialkin. It's unclear to me why it took so long for counsel to receive the 9/5/02 order. In any event, the Attorney General may have an extension to noon on 9/25/02 to serve & file any response . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 09/20/2002)
09/18/2002	162	Letter filed by Sheldon Silver addressed to Chief Judge Walker and Judges Berman and Koeltl from Nancy R. Sills, dated 9/12/02; Re: respond to the pending fee applications of the Hon. Lacey, Special Master appointed by this Court. (sac) (Entered: 09/24/2002)
09/23/2002	164	SECOND AMENDED COMPLAINT-IN-INTERVENTION by Sandra Rivers, Rosemary Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford, Leslie Barbour, Michelle Romero, William O. Low, Cecilia Guterrez, Evelyn Miller, Seretta C. McKnight, Tracey Edwards, Donna Swain (Answer due 10/3/02 for George E. Pataki, for Mary O. Donohue, for Eliot Spitzer, for Joseph L. Bruno, for Sheldon Silver, for John J. Faso, for Martin E. Connor, for Carol Berman, for Neil W. Kelleher, for Helena M. Donohue, for Evelyn J. Aquila) amending [134-1] intervenor complaint . Summons issued. (sac) (Entered: 10/02/2002)
09/25/2002	165	DECLARATION of Joel Graber by Eliot Spitzer Re: fee applications of the

		special master and the referee, for purposes of providing the Court with information about fee awards to masters and referees in connection with State legislative and Congressional redistricting in 1992 and in 1982. (dle) (Entered: 10/03/2002)
09/25/2002	166	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Eliot Spitzer re: in response to the fee applications of the master and the referee. (dle) (Entered: 10/03/2002)
10/04/2002	167	MEMORANDUM by Frederick B. Lacey in Response to the Attorney General's Objections to the Special Master's Fee Application; (dj) (Entered: 10/09/2002)
10/04/2002	168	DECLARATION of William G. Primps of the firm of LeBoeuf, Lamb, Greene & MacRae, LLP in response to Objections of the Attorney General of the State of New York to the fee application of special master Frederick B. Lacey. (ae) (Entered: 10/16/2002)
10/15/2002	169	STIPULATION; reset answer to the Second Amended Complaint of intervenors Sandra Rivers, et al. due for 10/17/02 for Sheldon Silver . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (pl) Modified on 10/22/2002 (Entered: 10/18/2002)
10/17/2002	171	ANSWER by Joseph L. Bruno to [164-1] second amended complaint . (Attorney Gregg M. Mashberg from the Firm: Proskauer Rose LLP). (pl) (Entered: 10/24/2002)
10/17/2002	172	ANSWER by Sheldon Silver to [164-1] second amended complaint . (Attorney Nancy R. Sills from the Firm: Graubard Miller). (pl) (Entered: 10/24/2002)
10/17/2002	173	ANSWER by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue to [164-1] second amended complaint . (Attorney Fredric S. Newman from the Firm: Hoguet Newman & Regal, LLP). (pl) (Entered: 10/24/2002)
10/18/2002	170	ANSWER by Eliot Spitzer, Charles Nesbitt to [164-1] second amended complaint. (Attorney Joel Graber). (db) (Entered: 10/23/2002)
10/22/2002	174	ANSWER by Eliot Spitzer, Charles Nesbitt to Amended Complaint-in-Intervention of Intervenors Lationo Voting Rights Committe of Metro New Yor, et al. (Attorney Joel Graber from the Firm: Attorney General of the State of New York). (pl) (Entered: 10/28/2002)
10/25/2002	175	ORDER, the three-judge Court orders that the State of New York shall forthwith pay to LeBoeuf, Lamb, Greene & MacRae, for the services of Frederick B. Lacey as Special Master in this case, the sum of \$664,137.85 together with interest thereon from the date of entry of this Order, and shall also pay to Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP, for the services of Kenneth J. Bialkin as Referee, the sum of \$297,118.50 together with interest thereon from the date of entry of this order . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (yv) (Entered: 10/31/2002)
10/30/2002	176	ORDER, that for the reasons set forth, Mr. Strunk's [100-1] motion for intervention is DENIED. Because the Court is dismissing the motion to intervene, Mr. Strunk's letter request for injunctive relief is denied, without

		prejudice, as moot. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman, Judge John G. Koeltl, and Chief Circuit Judge John M. Walker, Jr. ). (tp) (Entered: 10/31/2002)
10/30/2002	177	NOTICE OF MOTION by Movant/Intervenor Christopher Earl Strunk for Judicial Intervention under the National Voter Registration Act ; Return Date not indicated; (djc) (Entered: 11/01/2002)
11/04/2002	178	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Cassandra F. Lentchner, dated 11/8/02; proposed motion to intervene to be filed on or before 11/15/02. Other parties to "meet & confer" & submit joint response on or before 11/29/02. Messrs. Chill & Emery requested to coordinate "meet & confer." Reply, if any, by proposed Intervenor due 12/6/02. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (sac) (Entered: 11/15/2002)
11/15/2002	179	NOTICE OF MOTION to intervene by Anthony Creaney, Thomas Terry ; Return Date not indicated; (djc) (Entered: 11/21/2002)
11/15/2002	180	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Anthony Creaney, Thomas Terry in support of [179-1] motion to intervene by Anthony Creaney, Thomas Terry. (djc) (Entered: 11/21/2002)
11/15/2002	181	ANSWER by Anthony Creaney, Thomas Terry to [164-1] second amended complaint Firm of: Perkiins Coie LLP by attorney Cassandra F. Lentchner (djc) (Entered: 11/26/2002)
11/25/2002	182	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Chief Judge Walker, Judge Berman and Judge Koeltl from John R. Braatz, dated 11/21/02. Re: dft Senator Bruno requests an extension of page limits to fifty pages for his moving brief and twenty-five pages for his reply brief, lets hear from plttf's & plttf-intervenor in a brief (2-3pp) joint letter before we set a conference, (We've got time to worry about page limits). Plttf's letter should be submitted by noon on 12/2/02 . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (db) Modified on 11/26/2002 (Entered: 11/26/2002)
12/03/2002	183	ORDER, all discovery issues should be taken up with Mag Maas but only after the parties have met and conferred in good faith in an effort to reach out of court resolution ; plntfs' and defts' counsel should submit a brief (2-4 pages) joint response, if any, to Mr. Strunk's request for reconsideration by 12/6/02 (noon) ; set status/scheduling conference for 12:00 12/30/02 ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (cd) (Entered: 12/04/2002)
12/09/2002	184	Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for General Pretrial/After Initial Case Management Conference held by District Judge. Referred to Magistrate Judge Frank Maas. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (tp) (Entered: 12/11/2002)
12/10/2002	185	ORDER, by order dated 10/29/02, the Court denied the Motion to intervene filed pro se by Christopher Earl Strunk; by letter dated 11/24/02, Mr. Strunk seeks reconsideration of the order. Mr. Strunk's application for reconsideration is denied. Judges Walker and Koeltl concur with this result . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (kw) (Entered: 12/12/2002)

12/12/2002	186	Letter filed by Christopher Earl Strunk addressed to Honorable Judges from Christopher Earl Strunk, dated 11/24/02, re: Request for reconsideration of Order denying Intervenor Motion, new related cause of action. (sb) (Entered: 12/18/2002)
12/18/2002	187	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Richard D. Emery, dated 12/17/02. Re: plaintiffs writes that a joint and consolidated amended would obviate the need for extensive motion practice with respect to Defendants' proposed motion for partial judgment on the pleadings. I'm not sure I agree & so Pls are requested to meet and confer forthwith to assess how a joint complaint would be crafted . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (kw) (Entered: 12/23/2002)
12/20/2002	188	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Maas from Richard D. Emery, dated 12/19/02. The Court is still seeking PLS' joint substantive reply (2-3pp) to Mr. Braetz' arguments). See 11/21/02 Memo Endorsement and submit by 12/23/02 at noon. See also the Court's memo endorsement of 12/18/02. It's for real . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (kw) (Entered: 12/23/2002)
12/20/2002	189	ORDER, discovery shall be stayed through the date of the conference and thereafter if Judge Berman agrees that the motion should be heard by the three-judge court, until the motion has been decided. The plaintiffs shall advise me of the briefing schedule set by Judge Berman and ensure that I receive a copy of any decision on the Motion within five days after it is rendered . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); Copies forwarded by chambers. (kw) (Entered: 12/26/2002)
12/26/2002	190	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Richard D. Emery, dated 12/23/02. Re: plaintiffs in response to the Court's 12/20/02 order. There is nothing to be sorry about. This is a helpful narrowing/focusing of the issues which is needed. Please prepare for joint Pls' & defs' presentations (all pls) on the 30th and then a consolidated (joint) amended complaint before any motions. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (kw) (Entered: 12/27/2002)
12/30/2002	191	Memorandum to Docket Clerk: that a status conference was held on 12/30/02 before Judge Berman . (pl) (Entered: 01/02/2003)
12/30/2002		Status Conference held on 12/30/02 before Judge Richard M. Berman . (pl) (Entered: 01/02/2003)
01/24/2003	192	JOINT AND CONSOLIDATED AMENDED COMPLAINT by Eric Rodriguez, Martin Malave-Divan, Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford, Council of Elected, Leslie Barbour, Michelle Romero, William O. Low, Cecilia Guterrez, Evelyn Miller, Seretta C. McKnight, Tracey Edwards, Donna Swain, Peter K. Lau, John Kuo Wei Tchen, Mindy Kim, Sachi Dastidar, Tara Singh, Latino Voting Rights (Answer due 2/3/03 for Helena M. Donohue, for Martin Malave-Divan, for Charles Nesbitt, for Helena M. Donohue, for Neil W. Kelleher, for Joseph L. Bruno, for Eliot Spitzer, for Mary O. Donohue, for George E. Pataki, for Helena M. Donohue, for Evelyn J. Aquila, for Neil W. Kelleher, for Carol

		Berman, for Sheldon Silver, for Joseph L. Bruno, for Eliot Spitzer, for Mary O. Donohue, for George E. Pataki, for Evelyn J. Aquila, for Neil W. Kelleher, for Carol Berman, for Sheldon Silver, for Joseph L. Bruno, for Eliot Spitzer, for Mary O. Donohue, for George E. Pataki ) amending against David A. Paterson; Summons issued. (tp) (Entered: 01/30/2003)
01/27/2003	193	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Maas from Arthur W. Greig, dated 1/27/03, to the extent that this suit is brought against the Senate Minority Leader in his official capacity, FRCP 35(d) provides for automatic substitution. If that is the only capacity in which Senator Connor was sued, he is no longer a party. As to a service list, I suggest that counsel either refer to the Court's docket sheet or contact any lawyer representing a party in the suit, who should be able to provide the requested information ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); (cd) (Entered: 01/30/2003)
01/29/2003	195	ORDER: the (unopposed) motion [179-1] to intervene, filed by intervenor-dfts Anthony Creaney and Thomas Terry on 11/15/02, is hereby GRANTED pursuant to FRCP 24(b). The [99-1], [99-2] motion for substitution of counsel, filed by the Minority Leader of the New York State Assembly on 6/17/02, was GRANTED at the hearing held on 6/28/02. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (db) (Entered: 02/03/2003)
02/03/2003	194	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Richard M. Berman for the date(s) of 12/30/02. (dt) (Entered: 02/03/2003)
02/27/2003	196	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from John R. Braatz, dated 2/21/03. Re: defendants requests that the Court allow 40 pages for the joint brief; O.K. to 40 pp for @ sides principal brief (normal margins & double spaced) . (signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (pl) (Entered: 03/03/2003)
03/04/2003	197	CORRECTED Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Richard M. Berman for the date(s) of December 30, 2002. (dt) (Entered: 03/04/2003)
03/07/2003	198	NOTICE OF MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, Anthony Creaney, Thomas Terry for an order pursuant to Rule 12(b)(6) of the FRCP dismissing Counts I,II,VI,VIII and IX of the Joint Consolidated Amended Complaint dated 1/24/03 . Declaration of John R. Braatz in support of motion attached. No Return date indicated. (db) (Entered: 03/10/2003)
03/07/2003	199	BRIEF by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, Anthony Creaney, Thomas Terry in support of [198-1] motion for an order pursuant to Rule 12(b)(6) of the FRCP dismissing Counts I,II,VI,VIII and IX of the Joint Consolidated Amended Complaint dated 1/24/03 (db) (Entered: 03/10/2003)
04/25/2003	200	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Richard M. Berman from Richard D. Emery, dated 4/24/03. Re:, counsel for plaintiffs request a short extension of time in which to file their brief in opposition to dfts' motion to dismiss until 4/28/03. Extensions granted . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (dle) (Entered: 04/25/2003)

04/28/2003	201	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Eric Rodriguez et al in opposition to [198-1] motion for an order pursuant to Rule 12(b)(6) of the FRCP dismissing Counts I,II,VI,VIII and IX of the Joint Consolidated Amended Complaint dated 1/24/03 . (cd) (Entered: 04/29/2003)
04/28/2003	202	DECLARATION of Eric Hecker by Eric Rodriguez et al in support Re: [201-1] opposition memorandum . (cd) (Entered: 04/29/2003)
05/01/2003	203	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Paul Wooten, dated 4/23/03. Granting on consent plaintiffs-intervenors requests to withdraw Count XI from the complaint . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (kw) (Entered: 05/02/2003)
05/16/2003	204	ORDER, set oral argument for 3:00 p.m. on 6/20/03 in the fifteenth floor courtroom at the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, NY, NY . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (kw) (Entered: 05/18/2003)
05/27/2003	205	REPLY MEMORANDUM by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue et al re: [198-1] motion for an order pursuant to Rule 12(b)(6) of FRCP dismissing Counts I,II,VI,VIII and IX of the Joint Consolidated Amended Complaint dated 1/24/03 . (cd) (Entered: 06/03/2003)
06/11/2003	206	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Thomas E. Fowler, dated 6/5/03. Re: counsel writes to the Court as an amicus curiae and potential intervenor, pro se. The parties may, if they wish, respond before a motion schedule is set with brief letters from plaintiffs (jointly) &/or defendants (jointly) served & filed by 6/13/03 (Noon). Contact Craig Archer if there are any question (8056721) . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (kw) (Entered: 06/12/2003)
06/16/2003	207	ORDER, Mr. Fowler may submit a motion to be heard as amicus curiae or to intervene by 6/30/03. Plaintiffs (jointly) and/or Defendants (jointly) may submit responses, if any, by 7/14/03. Mr. Fowler may reply, if necessary, within one week of Plaintiffs' and/or Defendants' responses, i.e., by 7/21/03. The Court does not perceive a need for oral argument at this time . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (kw) (Entered: 06/17/2003)
06/25/2003	208	ORDER: that upon oral argument held on 6/20/03, the three-judge Court hereby denies defendants' motion to dismiss counts I,II, VI, VIII, and IX of Plaintiffs' Joint and Consolidated Amended Complained pursuant to F.R.C.P. 12(b)(6) (document #198); the parties are hereby directed to appear at a scheduling conference with Judge Berman on 6/26/03 at 3:00 p.m., in Courtroom 706 of the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Street, New York, New York . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (db) Modified on 07/30/2003 (Entered: 06/25/2003)
06/26/2003	213	Memorandum to Docket Clerk: Status conference held on 6/26/06. (ph) (Entered: 07/14/2003)
06/26/2003		Status Conference held on 6/26/03 before Judge Richard M. Berman. Summary judgment by 9/26/03. Answer by 10/17/03. Reply by 10/27/03. Discovery by 9/5/03. Plaintiff motion to compel due 7/3/03. Defendant's response due 7/11/03. (ph) (Entered: 07/14/2003)

06/26/2003		Deadline(s) updated: set scheduling order deadlines: Deadline for filing of all motions by 7/3/03 ; Response to motion deadline 7/11/03 ; , and Summary Judgment/Motion by 9/26/03; Answer by 10/17/03; Reply by 10/27/03 , and set scheduling order deadlines: Discovery cutoff 9/5/03 ; . (ph) (Entered: 07/14/2003)
07/03/2003	209	ORDER, the schedule for motions concerning the legislative privilege is modified to permit the service of a reply by 7/15/03. Telephone conference set for 7/31/03 at 5:00 p.m. All fact and expert discovery shall be completed by 9/5/03. (See document for further related discovery schedule) . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); Copies mailed by chambers. (kw) (Entered: 07/08/2003)
07/03/2003		Deadline updated: telephone conference set for 5:00 p.m. on 7/31/03 . (kw) (Entered: 07/08/2003)
07/08/2003	210	ORDER: the Court extends the discovery deadline two weeks until 9/19/03, but the briefing schedule is unchanged . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (db) (Entered: 07/08/2003)
07/10/2003	211	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Maas from Richard D. Emery, dated 7/8/03. Reset discovery due for 9/19/03. (See document for further related discovery schedule). The PTC date remains unchanged . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); (kw) (Entered: 07/11/2003)
07/11/2003	212	ANSWER by Sheldon Silver, Anthony Creaney, Thomas Terry to [192-1] amended complaint. (Attorney Nancy R. Sills from the Firm: Graubard Miller). (sb) (Entered: 07/14/2003)
07/15/2003	214	ANSWER by Eliot Spitzer, Charles Nesbitt to [192-1] amended complaint . (Attorney Eliot L. Spitzer, Joel Graber from the). (dle) (Entered: 07/16/2003)
07/16/2003	215	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Maas from Nancy R. Sills, dated 7/14/03. Granting defendant Sheldon Silver's request for an adjournment until 7/21/03 to respond to plaintiffs-intervenors' document demands and interrogatories . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); (kw) (Entered: 07/17/2003)
07/18/2003	216	ANSWER by Joseph L. Bruno to [192-1] amended complaint . (Attorney John Richard Braatz, Gregg M. Mashberg from the Firm: Proskauer Rose LLP). (djc) (Entered: 07/21/2003)
07/18/2003	241	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judges Richard M. Berman, John M. Walker, Jr, and John G. Koeltl for the date(s) of 6/20/03. (tr) (Entered: 08/29/2003)
07/18/2003	242	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Richard M. Berman for the date(s) of 6/26/03. (df) (Entered: 09/02/2003)
07/21/2003	217	ANSWER by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue to [192-1] amended complaint . (Attorney Ira J. Lipton from the Firm: Hogue, Newman & Regal, LLP). (dle) (Entered: 07/28/2003)
07/23/2003		Telephone Conference held on 7/23/03 before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas.

		(ph) (Entered: 08/11/2003)
07/24/2003	223	Memorandum to Docket Clerk: Telephone conference held on 7/23/03 before Magistrate Judge Maas. (ph) Modified on 08/11/2003 (Entered: 08/11/2003)
07/28/2003		Telephone Conference held before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas . (jw) (Entered: 08/12/2003)
07/29/2003	218	ORDER, on or before 7/31/03, the Rivers/Barbour plaintiff-intervenors shall serve and file their expert reports. On or before 8/4/03, the Rivers/Barbour plaintiff-intervenors shall serve their amended interrogatory responses , on or before 7/31/03, the Rivers/Barbour plaintiff-intervenors shall provide any additional information requested by the defendants' interrogatories, as modified during today's conference . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); Copies sent by Chambers. (yv) (Entered: 07/31/2003)
07/29/2003	219	OPINION AND ORDER #88818, that the plaintiffs' letter motion to compel is granted in part and denied in part. The legislator-defendants' claims of legislative or deliberate process privilege are sustained only insofar as the plaintiffs seek to intrude on deliberations or discussions which took place after the proposed 2002 redistricting plan reached the Legislature's floor. Accordingly, the defendants are instructed to respond to the plaintiffs' discovery requests concerning LATFOR, unless they contend that another privilege is applicable. If the legislator-defendants continue to claim privilege with respect to any of the documents on Senator Bruno's privilege log, counsel shall confer in an effort to resolve their differences. if the privilege concerns raised by the log cannot be resolved informally, the defendants are instructed to serve a revised privilege log before the 7/31/03 telephone conference . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); Copies mailed to Lead counsel by Chambers. (tp) (Entered: 07/31/2003)
07/31/2003	220	ORDER, Footnote of my Opinion and Order dated 7/28/03, inaccurately indicated that the Court's 6/24/03 order was not docketed (See docket no. 208). Accordingly, this footnote is deleted, and the remaining footnotes are renumbered as Footnotes 2 through 6 . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); Copies mailed by Chambers. (sb) (Entered: 08/04/2003)
07/31/2003	229	Memorandum to Docket Clerk: Telephone conference held on 7/31/03. (ph) (Entered: 08/18/2003)
07/31/2003		Telephone Conference held on 7/31/03 before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas. (ph) (Entered: 08/18/2003)
08/05/2003	221	ORDER: all objections to the 7/28/03 opinion and order shall be filed by 8/6/03, with responses to be filed by 8/11/03; should plttf Eric Rodriguez choose to file a motion to dismiss the complaint as against Senator Bruno, the motion shall be filed by 8/6/03, with the opposition papers due 8/11/03; the Rivers/COBED plttf intervenors shall serve the portion of their expert report that has been completed by 7/31/03. The completed expert report shall be served by 8/6/03; PRLDF shall serve its demographic expert's report by 8/1/03 and its historical expert's report by 8/6/03. Dfts shall serve their reports rebutting these reports by 9/3/03; by 8/1/03, the COBED plttf-intervenors shall provide Assemblyman Silver with a witness list which summarizes each

		witness's proposed testimony; a further telephone conference shall be held on 8/12/03 at 5:00 p.m. Lead counsel for plttfs shall initiate the call using the main number for my Chambers as further set forth in said order . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); Copies Mailed by Chambers. (db) (Entered: 08/08/2003)
08/06/2003	222	Objection(s) by Joseph L. Bruno to [219-1] order that the plaintiffs' letter motion to compel is granted in part and denied in part. The legislator-defendants' claims of legislative or deliberate process privilege are sustained only insofar as the plaintiffs seek to intrude on deliberations or discussions which took place after the proposed 2002 redistricting plan reached the Legislature's floor. Accordingly, the defendants are instructed to respond to the plaintiffs' discovery requests concerning LATFOR, unless they contend that another privilege is applicable. If the legislator-defendants continue to claim privilege with respect to any of the documents on Senator Bruno's privilege log, counsel shall confer in an effort to resolve their differences. If the privilege concerns raised by the log cannot be resolved informally, the defendants are instructed to serve a revised privilege log before the 7/31/03 telephone confernece . (cd) (Entered: 08/08/2003)
08/11/2003	224	RESPONSE by Eric Rodriguez, Martin Malave-Divan to Senator Bruno's [222-1] objections to the opinion and order of Magistrate Judge Maas dated 7/28/03. (dle) (Entered: 08/12/2003)
08/12/2003	225	NOTICE OF MOTION (filed on service date) by Joseph L. Bruno for an Order disqualifying Dr. Lisa Handley from serving as an expert witness for plaintiffs in this case . Return Date not indicated. Received in night deposit box on 8/12/03 at 5:00 p.m. (yv) Modified on 08/14/2003 (Entered: 08/14/2003)
08/12/2003	226	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Joseph L. Bruno in support of [225-1] motion for an Order disqualifying Dr. Lisa Handley from serving as an expert witness for plaintiffs in this case. Received in night deposit box on 8/12/03 at 5:01 p.m. (yv) (Entered: 08/14/2003)
08/12/2003	228	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Michael A. Carvin, dated 8/8/03. counsel for Senator Bruno responds to plaintiffs' letter. First, this is the kind of issue counsel should be able to resolve. Second, there is no change in the summary judgment schedule. Third, plaintiff may have to noon on 8/18/ to serve and file expert reports and defendants may have until 9/12/03 noon to serve and file theirs. Counsel should time depositions accordingly . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (yv) (Entered: 08/18/2003)
08/12/2003		Telephone Conference held before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas . (cd) (Entered: 08/18/2003)
08/13/2003	227	ORDER, reset plntf intervenors answers to interrogatories due for 8/14/03 and as further set forth in this document ; set telephone conference for 5:15 9/3/03, lead counsel for plntfs shall initiate the call ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); copies sent by chambers (cd) (Entered: 08/14/2003)
08/13/2003	230	REPLY in further support of objections by Joseph L. Bruno o the opinion and

		order of Magistrate Frank Maas dated 7/28/03. (dle) (Entered: 08/18/2003)
08/13/2003	231	Letter filed addressed to Judge Walker, Berman, Koeltl from NYS Assembly by C. Daniel Chill, dated 8/12/03, re: motion of Senator and Speaker Silver to dismiss (cd) (Entered: 08/19/2003)
08/13/2003	240	Memorandum to Docket Clerk: Status conference held. (ja) (Entered: 08/28/2003)
08/13/2003		Status Conference held before Judge Richard M. Berman . (ja) (Entered: 08/28/2003)
08/18/2003	232	ORDER; The Court affirms Magistrate Judge Maas's Order. Judges Walker and Koeltl concur with this result . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (jco) (Entered: 08/19/2003)
08/18/2003	233	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Mag. Judge Maas from Eric Hecker, dated 8/13/03; granting plaintiffs requests for permission to file and serve their opposition papers by 8/26/03 to dft's motion to disqualify one of plaintiffs experts, Dr Lisa Handley . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); (pl) Modified on 08/20/2003 (Entered: 08/20/2003)
08/19/2003	234	ORDER, The Court extends the discovery deadline to 9/26/03 and the Court revises the summary judgment briefing schedule so that defendants (only) to submit their joint summary judgment motion on or before 10/3/03; plaintiffs and plaintiff-intervenors (only) to submit their joint response on or before 10/23/03, and defendants to submit any reply on or before 10/31/03. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (sb) (Entered: 08/21/2003)
08/21/2003	235	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Richard D. Emery, dated 8/20/03; Re: the Law Firm of Emery, Celli, Cuti Brinclerhoff & Abady write to the Court to request that the Court clarify the briefing schedule for any summary judgment motion that Plaintiffs may file; the 8/19/03 was intended to be clear -- 1 motion, PLs should include their arguments in their 10/23/03 response including limitation arguments supporting any application for summary judgment . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (pl) Modified on 08/25/2003 (Entered: 08/25/2003)
08/22/2003	236	ORDER: the COBED plttf-intervenors shall provide Speaker Silver with tentative dates for the depositions of their fact witnesses by 8/22/03. The Senate dfts shall provide the Rodriguez plttfs with a revised privilege log by 8/22/03, and shall provide me with a copy of the log, together with any documents for which they claim privilege, by 8/25/03. the dfts shall serve expert reports not affected by the plttfs' change of experts by 8/26/03. A further telephone conference is set for 8/27/03 10:00 a.m. Lead counsel for plttfs shall initiate the call using the main number for my Chambers. Dfts shall identify their experts and fact witnesses by 9/5/03 . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); Copies Mailed by Chambers. (db) (Entered: 08/25/2003)
08/22/2003	237	NOTICE OF MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) by Joseph L. Bruno for an order pursuant to Rule 1.3(c) of the FRCP permitting Luis K. Fisher to appear pro hac vice . No Return Date indicated. Received in night deposit box on 8/22/03 at 5:30 p.m. (db) Modified on 08/27/2003 (Entered: 08/27/2003)

08/22/2003	238	AFFIDAVIT of Louis K. Fisher by Joseph L. Bruno in support of [237-1] motion for an order pursuant to Rule 1.3(c) of the FRCP permitting Luis K. Fisher to appear pro hac vice. Received in night deposit box on 8/22/03 at 5:30 p.m. (db) (Entered: 08/27/2003)
08/22/2003	239	AFFIDAVIT of John R. Braatz by Joseph L. Bruno in support of [237-1] motion for an order pursuant to Rule 1.3(c) of the FRCP permitting Luis K. Fisher to appear pro hac vice. Received in night deposit box on 8/22/03 at 5:30 p.m. (db) (Entered: 08/27/2003)
08/29/2003	244	ORDER; Mr. Seabrook shall be deposed on 9/11/03 at 10:00 a.m. at the offices of Graubard Miller. Should the parties be unable to resolve their scheduling disputes, the Court will hold a further conference on 9/2/03 at 6:00 p.m. The parties are directed to advise my Chambers by 4 p.m. that day whether the conference will be necessary. ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); Copies mailed by Chamber (sac) (Entered: 09/03/2003)
09/02/2003	243	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Richard M. Berman for the date(s) of 6/26/03. (df) (Entered: 09/02/2003)
09/02/2003	246	DECLARATION of Dr. Lisa Handley by Eric Rodriguez, Martin Malave-Divan, Patricia McDow, Lisa Best, Victor Oluwole, Ruben Rangel, Iris Pellerano, Russell Velazquez, Guillermo Linares, Isabel Evangelista, Martha L. Pepin, Marisefa Reyes, Maria Urena, Tyrone Zimmerman, Jose Alvarado, Irvin McManus, Wayne Hall, Samuel Prioleau, William Rodriguez, Neville Mullings, Mary Adams, Eugene A. Burnett Sr., Hazel Palmore, Johnny W. Velez, Judith Cruz. (dle) (Entered: 09/09/2003)
09/02/2003	247	RESPONSE by Eric Rodriguez, Martin Malave-Divan, Patricia McDow, Lisa Best, Victor Oluwole, Ruben Rangel, Iris Pellerano, Russell Velazquez, Guillermo Linares, Isabel Evangelista, Martha L. Pepin, Marisefa Reyes, Maria Urena, Tyrone Zimmerman, Jose Alvarado, Irvin McManus, Wayne Hall, Samuel Prioleau, William Rodriguez, Neville Mullings, Mary Adams, Eugene A. Burnett Sr., Hazel Palmore, Johnny W. Velez, Judith Cruz to plaintiff's [225-1] motion for an Order disqualifying Dr. Lisa Handley from serving as an expert witness for plaintiffs in this case (dle) (Entered: 09/09/2003)
09/02/2003	250	Memorandum to Docket Clerk: Discovery conference held on 9/2/03 before Magistrate Judge Maas. (ph) (Entered: 09/15/2003)
09/02/2003		Discovery Hearing held on 9/2/03 before Judge Richard M. Berman. (ph) (Entered: 09/15/2003)
09/03/2003	245	ORDER, granting [237-1] motion for an order pursuant to Rule 1.3(c) of the FRCP permitting Luis K. Fisher to appear pro hac vice. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (Sent to the Attorney Admissions Clerk). (kw) (Entered: 09/04/2003)
09/03/2003	251	Memorandum to Docket Clerk: Telephone conference held on 9/3/03. (ph) (Entered: 09/15/2003)
09/03/2003		Telephone Conference held on 9/3/03 before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas.

		(ph) (Entered: 09/15/2003)
09/04/2003	249	ORDER; the deadline for the COBED Plaintiff-Intervenors to provide Defendants with a sworn factual statement by Mr. Seabrook is extended until 09/03/03, but said statement shall be for attorneys' and experts' eyes only until September 11, 2003. The COBED Plaintiff Intervenors shall not be required to provide Defendant with any other witness statements ; By 09/03/03, the COBED Plaintiff Intervenors and Defendants shall submit a joint proposed order to the Court with a schedule of the dates and times for witness depositions fixed at today's conference. On or before 09/04/03 the COBED Plaintiff Intervenors shall provide Defendants with Ms. Darling's signed report ; ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); copies forwarded by Chambers; (djc) (Entered: 09/10/2003)
09/08/2003	248	STIPULATION and ORDER; that pursuant to a conference held on 9/2/03, the depositions of individuals listed herein and shall be held at the following dates and times stated in this Order . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ) (pl) (Entered: 09/10/2003)
09/11/2003	252	MEMORANDUM DECISION, The defendants are directed to produce to the plaintiffs within two days (1) any previously withheld documents which relate to the decision to increase the size of the New York State Senate in 2002, (2) the 12/31/01 memorandum from Burgeson to Senator Skelos, (3) any expert opinions referred to in Latfor's DOJ submission which were prepared prior to 4/30/02, and (4) any SAS macros, subroutines or programs which may be used in connection with racial block voting analyses of Census or other data . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); Copies sent by Chambers. (sb) (Entered: 09/16/2003)
09/11/2003		Telephone Conference held before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas . (ae) (Entered: 10/01/2003)
09/15/2003	253	ORDER, A further telephone conference will be held on 9/22/03 at 5:00 p.m. Other deadlines set forth on this order. ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ) (sb) (Entered: 09/18/2003)
09/15/2003	254	ORDER, The Court wishes to review the privileged documents involving Handley, and directs that they be submitted for in camera review . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); Copies mailed by Chambers. (sb) (Entered: 09/18/2003)
09/15/2003	256	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Maas from Louis K. Fisher, dated 9/11/03. For essentially the same reasons that I directed the defendants to produce 12/13/01, Burgesore memo, documents S30013 - 14 are to be produce. Lead counsel are directed to sent this memo endorsement to the other counsel in this case . ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); Copies forwarded by chambers. (kw) (Entered: 09/19/2003)
09/16/2003	255	NOTICE OF MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) by Eric Rodriguez, Martin Malave-Divan, Patricia McDow, Lisa Best, Victor Oluwole, Ruben Rangel, Iris Pellerano, Russell Velazquez, Guillermo Linares, Evangelista, Martha L. Pepin, Marisefa Reyes, Maria Urena, Tyrone Zimmerman, Jose Alvarado, Irvin McManus, Wayne Hall, Samuel Prioleau, William Rodriguez,

		Neville Mullings, Mary Adams, Eugene A. Burnett Sr., Hazel Palmore, Johnny W. Velez, Judith Cruz for H. Reed Witherby to appear pro hac vice . Declaration of H. Reed Witherby in support attached. Return Date not indicated. (moc) (Entered: 09/19/2003)
09/17/2003	257	Objection(s) by Eric Rodriguez, Martin Malave-Divan, Patricia McDow, Lisa Best, Victor Oluwole, Ruben Rangel, Iris Pellerano, Russell Velazquez, Guillermo Linares, Isabel Evangelista, Martha L. Pepin, Marisefa Reyes, Maria Urena, Tyrone Zimmerman, Jose Alvarado, Irvin McManus, Wayne Hall, Samuel Prioleau, William Rodriguez, Neville Mullings, Mary Adams, Eugene A. Burnett Sr., Hazel Palmore, Johnny W. Velez, Judith Cruz to the privilege rulings of magistrate Judge Frank Maas and requests for rulings on unresolved issues. (db) (Entered: 09/22/2003)
09/17/2003	258	DECLARATION of Eric Hecker by Eric Rodriguez, Martin Malave-Divan, Patricia McDow, Lisa Best, Victor Oluwole, Ruben Rangel, Iris Pellerano, Russell Velazquez, Guillermo Linares, Isabel Evangelista, Martha L. Pepin, Marisefa Reyes, Maria Urena, Tyrone Zimmerman, Jose Alvarado, Irvin McManus, Wayne Hall, Samuel Prioleau, William Rodriguez, Neville Mullings, Mary Adams, Eugene A. Burnett Sr., Hazel Palmore, Johnny W. Velez, Judith Cruz in support of plttfs [257-1] objection. (db) (Entered: 09/22/2003)
09/17/2003	259	Objection(s) by Joseph L. Bruno to [252-1] order The defendants are directed to produce to the plaintiffs within two days (1) any previously withheld documents which relate to the decision to increase the size of the New York State Senate in 2002, (2) the 12/31/01 memorandum from Burgeson to Senator Skelos, (3) any expert opinions referred to in Latfor's DOJ submission which were prepared prior to 4/30/02, and (4) any SAS macros, subroutines or programs which may be used in connection with racial block voting analyses of Census or other data . (cd) (Entered: 09/23/2003)
09/18/2003	260	RESPONSE by Joseph L. Bruno to [257-1] plaintiffs' 9/17/03 objections. Received in the night deposit box on 9/18/03 at 8:44 p.m. (sb) (Entered: 09/24/2003)
09/18/2003	261	RESPONSE by Joseph L. Bruno to [257-1] objections to the privilege rulings of the Magistrate Judge Frank Maas. (sb) (Entered: 09/24/2003)
09/22/2003		Telephone Conference held before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas . (ae) (Entered: 10/01/2003)
09/23/2003	262	NOTICE OF MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) by Latino Voting Comm. to appeal Magistrate Judge Frank Maas' discovery order dated 9/22/03 pursuant to FRCP Rule 72(a) . Return Date not indicated. (moc) (Entered: 09/25/2003)
09/23/2003	263	ORDER granting [255-1] motion for H. Reed Witherby to appear pro hac vice. Subject to payment of fee with Clerk's Office ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); orig forwarded to the Atty Admissions Clerk (cd) (Entered: 09/25/2003)
09/23/2003	264	ORDER, For the reasons stated in this order, the Court affirms Magistrate

		Judge Maas' Orders. The parties may need to adopt a more cooperative (with one another) and economical and flexible approach vis-a-vis summary judgment and trial of this case both of which are expected to be completed during November/December 20003 . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (sb) (Entered: 09/25/2003)
09/24/2003	265	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Richard M. Berman from John Braatz, dated 9/22/03. Re:, counsel for Senator Bruno requests an expansion of the page limits to fifty pages for the opening briefs on each side and 25 pages for the reply. Application granted in part: Defs' joint brief up to 40 pp; pla's joint response up to 40pp; def's reply up to 15pp. conference with the court on 9/30/03 at 9:30 in courtroom 706 to discuss next steps & counsels' apparent disregard of FRCP 1 ( in all respects); double space; normal margins; 12' font . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (dle) (Entered: 09/26/2003)
09/24/2003	266	Objections by Joseph L. Bruno to the Order of Mag. Judge Maas dated 9/23/03. (sb) (Entered: 09/26/2003)
09/24/2003	267	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Koeltl from John R. Braatz, dated 9/23/03. Counsel for defendants requests that if plaintiffs are granted additional pages in connection with their cross motion for summary judgment, defendants would request the same number of additional pages to respond to plaintiffs' cross motion. We can discuss at the forth-coming conference. It would be helpful for counsel to avoid the petty bickering which has characterized recent filings as the case moves forward . signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (sb) (Entered: 09/29/2003)
09/24/2003	269	Objection(s) by Joseph L. Bruno to Magistrate Judge Maas' order of 9/24/03. Received in night deposit on 9/24/03 at 8:02 p.m. (moc) (Entered: 09/29/2003)
09/25/2003	268	RESPONSE by Joseph L. Bruno to plaintiffs' objection to Magistrate Judge Maas' 9/22/03 order. (moc) (Entered: 09/29/2003)
09/25/2003		Telephone Conference held before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas . (ae) (Entered: 10/01/2003)
09/26/2003	270	ORDER; the Court affirms Magistrate Judge Maas's Orders. Chief Judge Walker and Judge Koeltl concur with this result. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ). (sac) Modified on 10/01/2003 (Entered: 09/30/2003)
09/29/2003	271	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Richard D. Emery, dated 9/26/03. Re: parties submit a joint list of proposed witnesses and documentation pursuant to the Courts 9/24/03 Order. The proposed list is duplicative and excessive and not appropriate for an efficient and fair trial. The parties are directed to submit a revised list of 20 witnesses total; 10 for all plttfs and plttfs intervenors; 10 for all dfts and dfts intervenors. Witnesses should be ranked in the order of importance to each side. Submit 2 copies to each Judge by noon on 9/29/03 . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (db) (Entered: 10/01/2003)
09/29/2003	272	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Foster S. Maer, dated 09/29/03; Application to postpone, etc., request for list of 20 witnesses is respectfully denied. Kindly adhere to Court directives and orders

		issued (which also includes no faxes under J. Berman's individual rules). The list is due by noon today ; ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (dj) (Entered: 10/01/2003)
09/29/2003	273	APPEAL by Defendant-Intervenors Helena M. Donohue, Anthony Creaney, Thomas Terry, Martin Malave-Divan, Helena M. Donohue, Charles Nesbitt, George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Neil W. Kelleher, Sheldon Silver, Carol Berman, Neil W. Kelleher, Evelyn J. Aquila, George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, and Defendant New York Assembly of Magistrate Judge's Order dated 9/23/03; Appeal to Three Judge Panel. (tp) (Entered: 10/01/2003)
09/29/2003	274	DECLARATION of Cassandra Lentchner by Defendant-Intervenors Helena M. Donohue, Anthony Creaney, Thomas Terry, Martin Malave-Divan, Helena M. Donohue, Charles Nesbitt, George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Neil W. Kelleher, Sheldon Silver, Carol Berman, Neil W. Kelleher, Evelyn J. Aquila, George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, and Defendant New York Assembly in support of their Appeal of Magistrate Judge's Order dated 9/23/03. (tp) (Entered: 10/01/2003)
09/29/2003	275	ORDER; denying [262-1] motion to appeal Magistrate Judge Frank Maas' discovery order dated 9/22/03 pursuant to FRCP Rule 72(a). ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (sb) (Entered: 10/01/2003)
09/30/2003		CASHIER'S OFFICE REMARK on order admitting H. Reed Witherby pro hac vice in the amount of \$25.00 paid on 9/30/03 Receipt # 486323. (dle) (Entered: 10/01/2003)
09/30/2003	276	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Maas from Paul Wooten, dated 9/29/03, granting a one day extension for Mr. Wootone to respond to deft COBED document ( signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas ); (cd) (Entered: 10/02/2003)
10/03/2003	277	NOTICE OF MOTION by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, John J. Faso for summary judgment purs to FRCP 56 ; Return Date not indicated attached are papers in support and accompanied with 4 volumes of Exhibits (cd) Modified on 10/07/2003 (Entered: 10/07/2003)
10/03/2003	278	AFFIDAVIT of C. by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, John J. Faso in support of [277-1] motion for summary judgment purs to FRCP 56 . (cd) (Entered: 10/07/2003)
10/03/2003	279	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Eliot Spitzer, Joseph L. Bruno, Sheldon Silver, John J. Faso in support of [277-1] motion for summary judgment purs to FRCP 56 . (cd) (Entered: 10/07/2003)
10/03/2003	280	NOTICE of Filing, of the annexed Letter to the Court, by Eliot Spitzer . (cd) (Entered: 10/07/2003)
10/08/2003	281	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Richard M. Berman for the date(s) of 8/13/03. (tr) (Entered: 10/08/2003)

10/20/2003	282	ORDER, regarding the issues concerning the respective submissions, and directing the measures set forth herein to be implemented in connection with the trial of this action, subject to any determinations that may be made regarding the pending motion filed by defendants and defendant-intervenors on 10/3/03 seeking summary Judgment. A Pretrial Conference will be held on Wednesday, 11/12/03 at 1:00 p.m., in Courtroom 704 of the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ). (tp) (Entered: 10/22/2003)
10/23/2003	291	NOTICE OF MOTION by plaintiffs, for an Order pursuant to Rule 56 of the FRCP granting plaintiffs' motion for summary judgment on Count One of the Joint and Consolidated Amended Complaint . Return Date 11/4/03. Declaration of Sarah Netburn along with Exhibits A through B are attached. (tp) (Entered: 11/05/2003)
10/23/2003	292	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by plaintiffs in opposition to defendants [277-1] motion for summary judgment, and in support of their Cross-motion for summary judgment. (tp) (Entered: 11/05/2003)
10/24/2003	283	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan, Howard T. Allen, Jeannette Santos, Donald J. Jirak, Richard Flateau, Charlotte A. Taylor, Mervyn A. Campbell, Sarah Brockus, Patricia McDow, Lisa Best, Victor Oluwole, Ruben Rangel, Iris Pellerano, Russell Velazquez, Guillermo Linares, Isabel Evangelista, Martha L. Pepin, Marisefa Reyes, Maria Urena, Tyrone Zimmerman, Jose Alvarado, Irvin McManus, Wayne Hall, Samuel Prioleau, William Rodriguez, Neville Mullings, Mary Adams, Eugene A. Burnett Sr., Hazel Palmore, Johnny W. Velez, Judith Cruz in opposition to [277-1] motion for summary judgment purs to FRCP 56 and in support of their cross-motion for summary judgment. (yv) (Entered: 10/29/2003)
10/30/2003	287	REVISED RESPONSE to dfts' Rule 56.1 Statement by Eric Rodriguez, Martin Malave-Divan. (dle) (Entered: 11/04/2003)
10/30/2003	288	Plaintiffs' Revised Exhibit 4. Report of Andrew A. Beveridge, Ph.D. (dle) (Entered: 11/04/2003)
10/30/2003	289	Plaintiffs' Exhibits to the declaration of Sarah Netburn. (dle) (Entered: 11/04/2003)
10/31/2003	284	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Joseph L. Bruno, George E. Pataki, Mary O. Donohue, Anthony Creaney, Thomas Terry, Sheldon Silver, Eliot Spitzer in further support of re: [277-1] motion for summary judgment purs to FRCP 56; and, in opposition to Plaintiffs' Cross Motion (sac) (Entered: 11/03/2003)
10/31/2003	285	DECLARATION of Mark Burgeson Re: based on personal knowledge of this action. (sac) (Entered: 11/03/2003)
10/31/2003	286	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of C. Daniel Chill by George E. Pataki in support re: [277-1] motion for summary judgment purs to FRCP 56. (sac) (Entered: 11/03/2003)
11/03/2003	290	REQUEST for Admissions by Sheldon Silver, Anthony Creaney, Thomas

		Terry (moc) (Entered: 11/05/2003)
11/05/2003	293	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Richard M. Berman for the date(s) of 9/30/03. (df) (Entered: 11/05/2003)
11/05/2003	294	Transcript of record of proceedings before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas for the date(s) of 9/3/03. (df) (Entered: 11/05/2003)
11/06/2003	295	ORDER, granting in part, denying in part [277-1] motion for summary judgment purs to FRCP 56, denying [291-1] motion for an Order pursuant to Rule 56 of the FRCP granting plaintiffs' motion for summary judgment on Count One of the Joint and Consolidated Amended Complaint; Counts III, V, and VII will proceed to trial, subject to the following modifications to Judge Berman's Order of 10/20/03. Trial will commence on 11/20/03 at 9:00 a.m. and conclude no later noon on 11/26/03 in ctrm 506 of the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, NY, NY. A pretrial conference will be held on 11/12/03 at 1:00 p.m. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (kw) (Entered: 11/06/2003)
11/06/2003	296	ORDER, Defendants' motion for summary judgment is granted in part and denied in part and Plaintiffs' cross-motion is denied, as further set forth on this order . A pretrial conference will be held on 11/12/03 at 1:00 p.m. in Courtroom 506, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY. ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ) (sb) (Entered: 11/10/2003)
11/07/2003	297	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Richard M. Berman from David Gouldin, dated 11/3/03. Re:, counsel for Doty requests that the court enter an order eliminating the parties we represent as parties to the pending Federal Court matter. Any remaining claims by or against Thomas Doty are hereby dismissed on consent . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (dle) (Entered: 11/10/2003)
11/12/2003	298	AFFIDAVIT of Joan Gibbs by Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford in opposition to [277-1] motion for summary judgment purs to FRCP 56 . (cd) (Entered: 11/18/2003)
11/12/2003	299	RESPONSE by Sandra Rivers, Rosemari Mealy, Ronald Cranshaw, Sandra Bradford Re: defts' 56.1 statement (cd) (Entered: 11/18/2003)
11/14/2003	300	DEFT BRUNO'S PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW (cd) (Entered: 11/19/2003)
11/17/2003	301	SECOND SUPPLEMENTAL STIPULATION OF UNDISPUTED FACTS. (jco) (Entered: 11/19/2003)
11/17/2003	302	Objection(s) by Joseph L. Bruno to [289-1] exhibits, [288-1] exhibits and plaintiffs direct testimony. (jco) (Entered: 11/19/2003)
11/17/2003	303	PRE-TRIAL BRIEF by Eric Rodriguez, Martin Malave-Divan (djc) (Entered: 11/19/2003)
11/17/2003	304	Objection(s) by Eric Rodriguez, James R. Jubilee, Martin Malave-Divan, Howard T. Allen, Jeannette Santos, Donald J. Jirak, Richard Flateau, Charlotte A. Taylor, Mervyn A. Campbell, Sarah Brockus, Patricia McDow, Lisa Best,

		Victor Oluwole, Ruben Rangel, Iris Pellerano, Russell Velazquez, Guillermo Linares, Isabel Evangelista, Martha L. Pepin, Marisefa Reyes, Maria Urena, Tyrone Zimmerman, Jose Alvarado, Irvin McManus, Wayne Hall, Samuel Prioleau, William Rodriguez, Neville Mullings, Mary Adams, Eugene A. Burnett Sr., Hazel Palmore, Johnny W. Velez, Judith Cruz to the direct testimony of Dr. Stephen Thernstrom. (yv) (Entered: 11/20/2003)
11/17/2003	305	Letter filed addressed to Judge Berman from Richard Emery, dated 11/14/03, re: the testimony of Dr. Handley. (moc) (Entered: 11/20/2003)
11/18/2003	306	RESPONSE by Joseph L. Bruno to pltffs objection to the testimony of Stephan Thernstrom. (db) (Entered: 11/20/2003)
11/18/2003	307	RESPONSE by Eric Rodriguez, Martin Malave-Divan to dfts [302-1] miscellaneous objections. (db) (Entered: 11/20/2003)
11/19/2003	308	Third Supplemental Stipulation of Undisputed Facts. (djc) (Entered: 11/20/2003)
11/19/2003	309	Memorandum to Docket Clerk: that a final pretrial conference was held on 11/19/03 before Judge Berman; Court reporter Eve Giniger present . (pl) (Entered: 11/20/2003)
11/19/2003		PRETRIAL CONFERENCE held on 11/19/03 before Judge Richard M. Berman. (pl) (Entered: 11/20/2003)
11/20/2003		Deadline(s) updated: set trial ready deadline 11/20/03 . (pl) (Entered: 11/20/2003)
11/20/2003	310	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Berman from Richard D. Emery, dated 8/20/03. The 8/19/03 order was intended to be clear--1 motion. Pls should include all their arguments in their 10/23/03 response, including without limitation arguments supporting any application for summary judgment . ( signed by Judge Richard M. Berman ); (kw) (Entered: 11/21/2003)
12/08/2003	314	Proposed Post-Trial Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law. Document filed by Mary Adams, Jose Alvarado, Lisa Best, Eugene A. Burnett Sr., Judith Cruz, Isabel Evangelista, Wayne Hall, Guillermo Linares, Martin Malave-Divan, Patricia McDow, Irvin McManus, Neville Mullings, Victor Oluwole, Hazel Palmore, Iris Pellerano, Martha L. Pepin, Samuel Prioleau, Ruben Rangel, Marisefa Reyes, Eric Rodriguez, William Rodriguez, Maria Urena, Russell Velazquez, Johnny W. Velez, Tyrone Zimmerman.(jco, ) (Entered: 12/29/2003)
12/09/2003	315	Proposed Post-Trial Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law. Document filed by Joseph L. Bruno.(jco, ) (Entered: 12/29/2003)
12/11/2003	316	PLAINTIFFS POST-TRIAL MEMORANDUM OF LAW. Document filed by Mary Adams, Jose Alvarado, Leslie Barbour, Raquel Emilia Batista, Lisa Best, Eugene A. Burnett Sr., Mayra Cappas, Alice Cardona, Ronald Cranshaw, Judith Cruz, Sachi Dastidar, Jose Dominguez, Tracey Edwards, Lynn Elfe, Isabel Evangelista, Arthur O. Eve, Charles H. Fisher III, David Galarza, David Gantt, Enrique Gomez, Beverly Gray, Cecilia Guterrez,

		Wayne Hall, Genaro Herrera, George A. Holt Jr., William Johnson, Ann Jones, Mindy Kim, Latino Voting Rights Committee of Metro New York, Latino Voting Rights Committee of Suffolk County, Peter K. Lau, Guillermo Linares, Joseph Lopez, William O. Low, Martin Malave-Divan, Patricia McDow, Seretta C. McKnight, Irvin McManus, Rosemari Mealy, Evelyn Miller, Neville Mullings, Patricia Mustaro, Wade Norwood, Victor Oluwole, Hazel Palmore, Iris Pellerano, Martha L. Pepin, James W. Pitts, Samuel Prioleau, Ruben Rangel, Marisefa Reyes, Sandra Rivers, Eric Rodriguez, William Rodriguez, Michelle Romero, Tara Singh, Louise Slaughter, Donna Swain, John Kuo Wei Tchen, Maria Urena, Russell Velazquez, Johnny W. Velez, Cherry Weinstein, Tyrone Zimmerman. Received in night deposit box on 12/11/03. (db, ) Modified on 12/30/2003 (db, ). (Entered: 12/30/2003)
12/11/2003	317	RESPONSE to plaintiffs proposed post-trial findings of fact and conclusions of law. Document filed by Joseph L. Bruno. Received in night deposit box on 12/11/03 at 11:23 p.m. (db, ) (Entered: 12/30/2003)
12/15/2003	311	CORRECTED TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on October 8, 2003, 9:35 a.m. before Judge Richard M. Berman.(dt, ) (Entered: 12/15/2003)
12/17/2003	312	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 11/19/03 before Judge Richard M. Berman.(jf, ) (Entered: 12/17/2003)
12/17/2003	313	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 11/20,21,24,25,26/03 before Judge Richard M. Berman.(jf, ) (Entered: 12/17/2003)
01/09/2004	318	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 11/4/04 before Judges John M. Walker, John G. Koeltl, Richard M. Berman. (pr, ) Modified on 1/9/2004 (pr, ). (Entered: 01/09/2004)
03/15/2004	319	OPINION AND ORDER #89805, that for the reasons explained herein, each of the claims by the plaintiffs and the plaintiffs-intervenors should be dismissed. The Clerk is therefore directed to enter judgment dismissing the complaint and closing this case. (Signed by Judge Richard M. Berman on 3/15/04) (tp, ) (Entered: 03/18/2004)
03/15/2004		Transmission to Judgments and Orders Clerk. Transmitted re: 319 Memorandum & Opinion, to the Judgments and Orders Clerk for preparation of Judgment. (tp, ) (Entered: 03/18/2004)
03/15/2004	321	ORDER that dfts' objection on relevance grounds to the admission of plaintiffs' exhibits (px) 18-21 and the testimony of Andrew Beverigge wiht respect to those exhibits is denied; dfts' objection on hearsay grounds to the admission of PS29,36-38 and 41 is granted provided that the court may take judicial notice of the reported decisions contained in those exhibits; dfts' objection on relevance grounds to the admission of PX 1 and 6 is denied; dfts' objection on relevance and hearsay grounds to the admission of PX5 is denied; dfts' objection on hearsay grounds to the admission of PS 14,28, 42, 45, 49 and 62 is denied; dfts' objection on hearsay grounds to the admission of PX 61 is granted as plaintiffs have not established its admissibility under FRE 803(8) or any other hearsay exception. (Signed by Judge Richard M. Berman on 3/15/04) (dle, ) (Entered: 03/19/2004)

03/19/2004	320	CLERK'S JUDGMENT in favor of defendants against and against the plaintiffs dismissing all plaintiff's and plaintiff-intervenor's claims, dismissing the complaint and closing the case. (Signed by J. Michael McMahon, Clerk on 03/19/04) (jf, ) (Entered: 03/19/2004)
03/23/2004		Mailed notice of Right to Appeal to Attorney(s) of Record: John Richard Braatz, C Daniel Chill, Joel Graber, Kenneth Kimerling, Cassandra Lentchner, Ira J. Lipton, Traci L. Lovitt, Glenn D. Magpantay, Gregg M. Mashberg, Fredric S. Newman, Nancy Rose Sills, Gregory Charles Soumas, Eliot L. Spitzer, Todd D. Valentine, H. Reed Witherby, Paul Wooten. (snu) (Entered: 03/23/2004)
05/13/2004	322	NOTICE OF APPEAL to the United States Supreme Court from the 320 Clerk's Judgment of the District Court. Document filed by Mary Adams, Howard T. Allen, Jose Alvarado, Lisa Best, Sarah Brockus, Eugene A. Burnett Sr., Mervyn A. Campbell, Isabel Evangelista, Richard Flateau, Wayne Hall, Donald J. Jirak, Guillermo Linares, Martin Malave-Divan, Patricia McDow, Irvin McManus, Neville Mullings, Victor Oluwole, Hazel Palmore, Martha L. Pepin, Samuel Prioleau, Ruben Rangel, Marisefa Reyes, Eric Rodriguez, William Rodriguez, Jeannette Santos, Charlotte A. Taylor, Maria Urena, Russell Velazquez, Johnny W. Velez, Tyrone Zimmerman. Copies of Notice of Appeal mailed to Attorney(s) of Record: Hoguet, Newman & Regal, L.L.P., Office of the Attorney General, NYS.; Jones, Day, Reavis & Pogue; Proskauer Rose, L.L.P.; Graubard Miller; Special Counsel to NYS Board of Elections; Paul, Wooten & Associates; Center for Law and Social Justice; Smith & Duggan, L.L.P.; Henry T. Berger, Esq.; Frederick K. Brewington, Esq.; Asian American Legal Defense and Education Fund; Puerto Rican Legal Defense and Education Fund; Perkins Coie, L.L.P. (tp, ) (Entered: 05/14/2004)
05/14/2004		Transmission of Notice of Appeal and Certified Copy of Docket Sheet to U.S. Supreme Court re: 322 Notice of Appeal. (tp, ) (Entered: 05/14/2004)
05/14/2004		Transmission of Notice of Appeal to U.S. Supreme Court to the District Judge re: 322 Notice of Appeal. (tp, ) (Entered: 05/14/2004)
05/17/2004		ORDER; that defendant's request is granted. A three-judge court of John M. Walker, Jr., Chief Circuit Judge; John G. Koeltl, District Judge and Richard M. Berman, District Judge is convened to hear and determine this action. This action is Consolidated 02-cv-618 (Lead Case) with following Member Case 02-cv-3843. Original Document filed in 02 Civ. 3843, Doc#6. (Signed by Judge John M. Walker on 5/23/02) (sac, ) (Entered: 05/17/2004)
06/25/2004	323	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 10/24/03 before Judge Richard M. Berman.(pa, ) (Entered: 06/25/2004)
07/15/2004	324	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 10/24/2003 before Judge Richard M. Berman.(jmi, ) (Entered: 07/15/2004)
08/25/2004		Supreme Court of the US Case Number 04-0218 assigned to 322 Notice of Appeal,,, filed by Jose Alvarado, William Rodriguez, Eric Rodriguez, Wayne Hall, Guillermo Linares, Martin Malave-Divan, Howard T. Allen, Jeannette Santos, Donald J. Jirak, Richard Flateau, Charlotte A. Taylor, Mervyn A.

		Campbell, Sarah Brockus, Patricia McDow, Lisa Best, Victor Oluwole, Ruben Rangel, Russell Velazquez, Isabel Evangelista, Martha L. Pepin, Marisefa Reyes, Maria Urena, Tyrone Zimmerman, Irvin McManus, Samuel Prioleau, Neville Mullings, Mary Adams, Hazel Palmore, Johnny W. Velez, Eugene A. Burnett. (pr, ) (Entered: 08/25/2004)
12/15/2004	325	LETTER addressed to Dear Clerk from William K. Suter, Clerk Supreme Court of the United States dated 11/29/04 The court today entered the following order,The judgment is affirmed. Justice Stevens would note probable jurisdiction & set the case for oral argument.(pr, ) (Entered: 12/15/2004)
01/12/2005	326	MANDATE of U.S. SUPREME COURT (Certified Copy) as to 322 Notice of Appeal,,, filed by Jose Alvarado,, William Rodriguez,, Eric Rodriguez,, Wayne Hall,, Guillermo Linares,, Martin Malave-Divan,, Howard T. Allen,, Jeannette Santos,, Donald J. Jirak,, Richard Flateau,, Charlotte A. Taylor,, Mervyn A. Campbell,, Sarah Brockus,, Patricia McDow,, Lisa Best,, Victor Oluwole,, Ruben Rangel,, Russell Velazquez,, Isabel Evangelista,, Martha L. Pepin,, Marisefa Reyes,, Maria Urena,, Tyrone Zimmerman,, Irvin McManus,, Samuel Prioleau,, Neville Mullings,, Mary Adams,, Hazel Palmore,, Johnny W. Velez,, Eugene A. Burnett, Sr. U.S. SUPREME COURT Case Number 04-218. ON APPEAL from the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York. THIS CAUSE having been submitted on the statement as to jurisdiction and the motion to affirm. ON CONSIDERATION WHEREOF, it is ordered and adjudged by this Court that the judgment of the above Court is AFFIRMED. William K. Sutter, Clerk U.S. SUPREME COURT. Issued As Mandate: 11/29/04. (dt, ) (Entered: 01/12/2005)
01/12/2005		Transmission of U.S.SUPREME COURT Mandate/Order to the District Judge re: 326 U.S. SUPREME COURT Mandate. (dt, ) (Entered: 01/12/2005)

<b>PACER Service Center</b>			
<b>Transaction Receipt</b>			
02/27/2012 19:53:37			
<b>PACER Login:</b>	jd6477	<b>Client Code:</b>	951677-600001
<b>Description:</b>	Docket Report	<b>Search Criteria:</b>	1:02-cv-00618-RMB-FM
<b>Billable Pages:</b>	30	<b>Cost:</b>	2.40